



2022/0394(COD)

11.10.2023

COMPROMISE AMENDMENTS 1 - 5

BLOCK 1 (Articles 1-3 and 18)

Draft report
Lídia Pereira
(PE745.292v02-00)

Establishing a Union certification framework for carbon removals

Proposal for a regulation
(COM(2022)0672 – C9-0399/2022 – 2022/0394(COD))

Compromise Amendment 1 Article 1, Recitals 1-4 (Subject matter and scope)

Compromise amendment replacing Amendments 25-28; 86-90; 308-333; 335-342; 344-349; 354, 480-483; 855; 891; AGRI 1; AGRI 28-30; AGRI 32 and corresponding Amendments 1-5; 92-101; 103-105; 109-128; 212; AGRI 2-4; ITRE 2 on Recitals 1-4

**Proposal for a regulation
Title 1**

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Proposal for a
REGULATION OF THE EUROPEAN
PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL
establishing a Union certification
framework for carbon removals

Proposal for a
REGULATION OF THE EUROPEAN
PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL
establishing a Union certification
framework for carbon removals, ***carbon
farming and carbon storage in products***

**Proposal for a regulation
Article 1 – title**

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Subject matter and scope

Subject matter and scope

**Proposal for a regulation
Article 1 – paragraph 1 – introductory part**

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

1. The objective of this Regulation is to facilitate the deployment of carbon removals by operators or groups of operators. To that end, this Regulation establishes a voluntary Union framework for the certification of carbon removals by laying down:

1. The objective of this Regulation is to facilitate ***and encourage*** the deployment ***and enhancement*** of carbon removals, ***carbon farming and carbon storage in products*** by operators or groups of operators ***as a complement to the irreversible and gradual reduction of anthropogenic greenhouse gas emissions across all sectors to meet the objectives and targets laid down in Regulation (EU) 2021/1119 and the goals of the Paris Agreement.*** To that end, this Regulation establishes a voluntary Union framework for the certification of carbon removals, ***carbon farming and carbon storage in***

products by laying down:

Proposal for a regulation
Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point a

Text proposed by the Commission

(a) quality criteria for **carbon removal** activities that take place in the Union;

Amendment

(a) quality criteria for activities that take place in the Union;

Proposal for a regulation
Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point b

Text proposed by the Commission

(b) rules for the verification and certification of **carbon removals**;

Amendment

(b) rules for the verification and certification of **activities**;

Proposal for a regulation
Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point c

Text proposed by the Commission

(c) rules for the functioning and recognition by the Commission of certification schemes.

Amendment

(c) rules for the functioning and recognition by the Commission of certification schemes.

Proposal for a regulation
Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point c a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(ca) rules on the issuance and use of certified units;

Proposal for a regulation
Article 1 – paragraph 2

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

2. This voluntary Union framework for the certification of carbon removals does not apply to emissions falling within the scope of Directive 2003/87/EC, with the exception of the storage of carbon dioxide emissions from sustainable biomass that are zero-rated in accordance

2. This voluntary Union framework for the certification of carbon removals, **carbon farming and carbon storage in products** does not apply to emissions falling within the scope of Directive 2003/87/EC, with the exception of the storage of carbon dioxide emissions from

with Annex IV thereto.

sustainable biomass that *meet the sustainability criteria and greenhouse gas emission saving criteria established under Directive (EU) 2018/2001 and are zero-rated in accordance with Annex IV of Directive 2003/87/EC.*

Proposal for a regulation

Article 1 – paragraph 2 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

2a. *Where a legal agreement has been concluded between the Union and a third country concerning atmospheric or biogenic carbon captured in the Union but geologically stored in a Member of the EEA, or in a country bordering the Union, and that Member of the EEA or that country applies the same legal requirements as the ones set out in Directive 2009/31/EC, this Regulation shall apply to those captured emissions.*

Proposal for a regulation

Recital 1

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(1) Under the Paris Agreement adopted under the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change²² ('the Paris Agreement'), the international community has agreed to hold the increase in the global average temperature well below 2° C above pre-industrial levels and to pursue efforts to limit the temperature increase to 1.5° C above pre-industrial levels. The Union and its Member States are Parties to the Paris Agreement and are strongly committed to its implementation by reduction of greenhouse gas emissions and increase in carbon removals.

(1) Under the Paris Agreement adopted under the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change²² ('the Paris Agreement'), the international community has agreed to hold the increase in the global average temperature well below 2° C above pre-industrial levels and to pursue efforts to limit the temperature increase to 1.5° C above pre-industrial levels. ***That commitment has been reinforced with the adoption under the UNFCCC of the Glasgow Climate Pact on 13 November 2021, in which the Conference of the Parties to the UNFCCC, serving as the meeting of the Parties to the Paris Agreement, recognises that the impacts of climate change will be much lower at a temperature increase of 1,5 °C, compared with 2 °C, and resolves***

to pursue efforts to limit the temperature increase to 1,5 °C. The Union and its Member States are Parties to the Paris Agreement and are strongly committed to its implementation by reduction of greenhouse gas emissions and increase in carbon removals *and carbon farming*.

²² Approved by Council Decision (EU) 2016/1841 of 5 October 2016 on the conclusion, on behalf of the European Union, of the Paris Agreement adopted under the United Framework Convention on Climate Change (OJ L 282, 19.10.2016, p. 1).

²² Approved by Council Decision (EU) 2016/1841 of 5 October 2016 on the conclusion, on behalf of the European Union, of the Paris Agreement adopted under the United Framework Convention on Climate Change (OJ L 282, 19.10.2016, p. 1).

Or. en

Proposal for a regulation

Recital 2

Text proposed by the Commission

(2) At a global scale, the latest report²³ by the International Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) points towards a decreasing likelihood of limiting global warming to 1.5 °C unless rapid and deep cuts in global greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions occur throughout the forthcoming decades. The IPCC report also clearly states that ‘the deployment of carbon dioxide removal to counterbalance hard-to-abate residual emissions is unavoidable if net-zero carbon dioxide (CO₂) or GHG emissions are to be achieved’. This will require the large-scale deployment of sustainable activities for capturing CO₂ from the atmosphere and durably storing it in geological reservoirs, terrestrial and marine ecosystems, or products. Today and with current policies, the Union is not on track to deliver the required carbon removals: carbon removals in terrestrial ecosystems have been decreasing in recent years, and no significant industrial carbon removals are currently taking place in the Union.

Amendment

(2) At a global scale, the latest report²³ by the International Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) points towards a decreasing likelihood of limiting global warming to 1.5 °C unless rapid and deep cuts in global greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions occur throughout the *ongoing and* forthcoming decades. The IPCC report also clearly states that ‘*while reaching net zero CO₂ or net zero GHG emissions requires deep and rapid reductions in gross emissions*, the deployment of carbon dioxide removal to counterbalance hard-to-abate residual emissions is unavoidable if net-zero carbon dioxide (CO₂) or GHG emissions are to be achieved’ *and that ‘carbon dioxide removal will be necessary to achieve net negative CO₂ emissions’*. This will require the large-scale deployment of *safe and* sustainable activities for capturing CO₂ from the atmosphere and durably storing it in geological reservoirs, terrestrial and marine ecosystems, or products. Today and with current policies, the Union is not on track to deliver the required carbon removals:

carbon removals in terrestrial ecosystems have been decreasing in recent years, and no significant industrial carbon removals are currently taking place in the Union.

²³ *IPCC Working Group III (2022). Technical Summary. In: Climate Change 2022: Mitigation of Climate Change. Sixth Assessment Report (link)*

²³ *IPCC (2023). Sixth Assessment Report (AR 6 Synthesis Report).*

Or. en

Proposal for a regulation

Recital 3

Text proposed by the Commission

(3) The aim of this Regulation is to develop a voluntary Union certification framework for carbon removals, with the view to incentivise the uptake of high-quality carbon removals, in full respect of the biodiversity and the zero-pollution objectives. It is a tool to support the achievement of the Union objectives under the Paris Agreement, notably the goal of collective climate neutrality by 2050 laid down in Regulation (EU) 2021/1119 of the European Parliament and of the Council²⁴. The Union also committed to generate negative emissions after 2050. An important instrument to enhance carbon removals in terrestrial ecosystems is Regulation (EU) 2018/841 of the European Parliament and of the Council²⁵, which **is currently under review. The objective of the review is to set out a Union net removals target of 310 Mt CO₂ eq by 2030, and to allocate respective targets to each Member State.**

²⁴ Regulation (EU) 2021/1119 of the

Amendment

(3) The aim of this Regulation is to develop a voluntary Union certification framework for carbon removals, **carbon farming and carbon storage in products**, with the view to incentivise the uptake of **safe, sustainable and** high-quality carbon removals, **carbon farming activities and carbon storage in products**, in full respect of the biodiversity and the zero-pollution objectives. It is a tool to support the achievement of the Union objectives under the Paris Agreement, notably the goal of collective climate neutrality by 2050 laid down in Regulation (EU) 2021/1119 of the European Parliament and of the Council²⁴, **as a complement to the irreversible and gradual reduction of anthropogenic greenhouse gas emissions across all sectors to meet the objectives and targets laid down in Regulation (EU) 2021/1119 and the goals of the Paris Agreement.** The Union also committed to generate negative emissions after 2050. An important instrument to enhance carbon removals in terrestrial ecosystems is Regulation (EU) 2018/841 of the European Parliament and of the Council²⁵.

²⁴ Regulation (EU) 2021/1119 of the

European Parliament and of the Council of 30 June 2021 establishing the framework for achieving climate neutrality and amending Regulations (EC) No 401/2009 and (EU) 2018/1999 ('European Climate Law') (OJ L 243, 9.7.2021, p. 1).

²⁵ Regulation (EU) 2018/841 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 30 May 2018 on the inclusion of greenhouse gas emissions and removals from land use, land use change and forestry in the 2030 climate and energy framework, and amending Regulation (EU) No 525/2013 and Decision No 529/2013/EU (OJ L 156, 19.6.2018, p. 1).

European Parliament and of the Council of 30 June 2021 establishing the framework for achieving climate neutrality and amending Regulations (EC) No 401/2009 and (EU) 2018/1999 ('European Climate Law') (OJ L 243, 9.7.2021, p. 1).

²⁵ Regulation (EU) 2018/841 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 30 May 2018 on the inclusion of greenhouse gas emissions and removals from land use, land use change and forestry in the 2030 climate and energy framework, and amending Regulation (EU) No 525/2013 and Decision No 529/2013/EU (OJ L 156, 19.6.2018, p. 1).

Or. en

Proposal for a regulation

Recital 4

Text proposed by the Commission

(4) The Union certification framework will support the development of carbon removal activities in the Union that result in an unambiguous net **carbon removal** benefit, while avoiding greenwashing. In the case of carbon farming, such certification framework should also encourage the uptake of **carbon removal** activities that generate co-benefits for biodiversity, therefore achieving the nature restoration targets set out in Union law on nature restoration. The Union certification framework will be instrumental in meeting the Union climate change mitigation objectives set in international agreements and in the Union legislation.

Proposal for a regulation

Recital 4a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(4) The Union certification framework will support the development of **activities regarding carbon removal, carbon farming and carbon storage in product** in the Union that result in an unambiguous net benefit, while avoiding greenwashing. In the case of carbon farming, such certification framework should also encourage the uptake of activities that generate co-benefits for biodiversity, therefore achieving the nature restoration targets set out in Union law on nature restoration. The Union certification framework will be instrumental in meeting the Union climate change mitigation objectives set in international agreements and in the Union legislation.

(4a) Several Members of the EEA and other third countries bordering the Union, such as Norway or Iceland, have

significant potential for geological carbon storage. Therefore, where a legal agreement has been concluded between the Union and a Member of the EEA or another third country bordering the Union and that country applies the same legal requirements as those set out in Directive 2009/31/EC, the Union certification framework should also apply to atmospheric or biogenic carbon captured in the Union but geologically stored in that Member of the EEA, or in that country bordering the Union.

**Compromise Amendment 2 Article 2(a), (b), (g), (h), (i), (o), Recital 5
(Key definitions and scope of the proposal: carbon removal / permanent storage / carbon farming / carbon storage in products / units)**

Compromise amendment replacing Amendments 29-35; 164; 356-374; 380-381; 399-409; 411-426; 428-436; 438; 443-463; 540; 577-580; ITRE 30-34; AGRI 34-36; AGRI 40-43; AGRI 45; AGRI 47-48 and corresponding Amendments 6-10; 107; 130-139; 141; 143-144; AGRI 5-6; AGRI 8; ITRE 7, ITRE 9-11, ITRE 13 on Recitals

Proposal for a regulation

Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point a

Text proposed by the Commission

(a) ‘carbon removal’ means *either* the storage of atmospheric or biogenic carbon *within geological carbon pools, biogenic carbon pools, long-lasting products and materials, and the marine environment, or the reduction of carbon release from a biogenic carbon pool to the atmosphere;*

Amendment

(a) ‘carbon removal’ means the *permanent* storage of atmospheric or biogenic carbon *for several centuries, which is not combined with Enhanced Hydrocarbon Recovery (EHR);*

Proposal for a regulation

Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point b

Text proposed by the Commission

(b) ‘carbon removal activity’ means *one or more practices or processes carried out by an operator resulting in permanent carbon storage, enhancing carbon*

Amendment

deleted

capture in a biogenic carbon pool, reducing the release of carbon from a biogenic carbon pool to the atmosphere, or storing atmospheric or biogenic carbon in long-lasting products or materials;

Proposal for a regulation

Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point g

Text proposed by the Commission

(g) ‘permanent carbon storage’ means a **carbon removal** activity that, under normal circumstances and using appropriate management practices, stores atmospheric or biogenic carbon for several centuries, including bioenergy with carbon capture and storage and direct air carbon capture and storage;

Amendment

(g) ‘permanent carbon storage’ means **an activity consisting of one or more practices or processes carried out by an operator** that, under normal circumstances and using appropriate management practices, stores atmospheric or biogenic carbon for several centuries **through geological storage or permanently bound carbon mineralisation**;

Proposal for a regulation

Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point i a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(ia) ‘geological storage of CO₂’ means geological storage as defined in Article 3(1) of Directive 2009/31/EC;

Proposal for a regulation

Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point o

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(o) ‘carbon removal unit’ means one tonne of certified net carbon removal benefit generated by a carbon removal **activity** and registered by a certification scheme.

(o) ‘carbon removal unit’ means one tonne of certified net carbon removal benefit generated by carbon removals and registered by a certification scheme.

Proposal for a regulation
Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point h

Text proposed by the Commission

(h) ‘carbon farming’ means a carbon **removal** activity related to land management **that results in the increase of carbon storage in living biomass, dead organic matter and soils by enhancing carbon capture and/or reducing the release of carbon to the atmosphere;**

Amendment

(h) ‘carbon farming’ means **an** activity related to land management, **coastal** management **or animal husbandry**, that results in carbon **farming sequestration or carbon farming emission reductions for a period of at least five years;**

Proposal for a regulation
Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point h b (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(hb) ‘carbon farming sequestration’ means an activity related to land management in the subcategories of the land use, land use change and forestry (LULUCF) sector covered by Article 2(1) of Regulation (EU) 2018/841 or related to coastal management, consisting of one or more carbon farming practices or processes carried out by an operator that results in the increase of atmospheric or biogenic carbon stored in biogenic carbon pools by enhancing carbon capture, as defined per activity in the certification methodology;

Proposal for a regulation
Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point o a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(oa) ‘carbon farming sequestration unit’ means one tonne of certified net carbon farming sequestration benefit generated by carbon farming sequestration.

Proposal for a regulation
Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point a a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(aa) ‘carbon farming emission reduction’ means an activity consisting of one or more carbon farming practices or processes carried out by an operator that results in the reduction of carbon release from a biogenic carbon pool, the reduction of N₂O release from agriculture soils or manure management, or the reduction of CH₄ release from enteric fermentation or manure management to the atmosphere through a carbon farming activity;

Proposal for a regulation
Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point o b (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(ob) ‘carbon farming emission reduction unit’ means one tonne of certified net carbon farming carbon reduction, net carbon farming nitrogen reduction or net carbon farming methane reduction benefit generated by carbon farming emission reduction and registered by a certification scheme, and separated and identified either as a ‘carbon farming emission reduction unit - carbon’, ‘carbon farming emission reduction unit - nitrogen’, or ‘carbon farming emission reduction unit - methane’;

Proposal for a regulation
Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point i

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(i) ‘carbon storage in products’ means a **carbon removal** activity that **stores** atmospheric and biogenic carbon in long-lasting products or materials;

(i) ‘carbon storage in products’ means an activity **consisting of one or more practices or processes carried out by an operator which ensures long-term storage of** atmospheric and biogenic carbon in

long-lasting *harvested wood* products or materials *for construction for at least five decades in a manner consistent with other Union environmental objectives, as well as Regulation (EU) 2018/841 and IPCC Guidelines as adopted by the Conference of the Parties to the UNFCCC or the Conference of the Parties serving as the Meeting of the Parties to the Paris Agreement;*

Proposal for a regulation

Article 8 – paragraph 2 – subparagraph 1 b (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

The technical certification methodologies for activities related to carbon storage in products shall only be developed following and on the basis of the report to be presented by the Commission in accordance with Article 17(3) Regulation (EU) 2018/841.

Proposal for a regulation

Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point o c (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(oc) ‘carbon storage product unit’ means one tonne of certified net carbon product sequestration benefit generated by carbon storage in products and registered by a certification scheme.

Proposal for a regulation

Article 18 – paragraph 2 - subparagraph 1 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

As part of the report in Article 18, paragraph 2, the Commission shall assess the possible benefits and trade-offs of the inclusion of other long-lived carbon storage products based on the latest

scientific evidence and may, where relevant, present a legislative proposal the Parliament and Council.

Corresponding recital 5, aligned with Articles above

Proposal for a regulation

Recital 5

Text proposed by the Commission

(5) In order to support operators willing to make additional efforts to increase carbon removals in a sustainable way, the Union certification framework should *take into account* the different types of *carbon removal* activities, their specificities and related environmental impacts. Therefore, this Regulation should provide clear definitions of *carbon removal, carbon removal activities, and other elements of* the Union certification framework.

Amendment

(5) *Activities regarding carbon removal, carbon farming and carbon storage in product have different characteristics as regards the storage process, the storage medium and the expected duration of the storage, which can vary from decades to centuries for certain carbon farming activities or storage in certain products, to permanent storage in geological formations if the geological storage site is appropriately selected and managed.* In order to *ensure the integrity of the framework while supporting* operators willing to make additional efforts to increase carbon *sequestration or biogenic emission reductions* in a sustainable way, the Union certification framework should *clearly distinguish* the different types of activities, their specificities and related environmental impacts. Therefore, this Regulation should *clearly separate the definitions, the quality criteria and the rules on the use related to activities regarding carbon removals, carbon farming and carbon storage in product in* the Union certification framework.

Proposal for a regulation

Recital 5a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(5a) *Under the Union certification framework, activities that, under normal circumstances and using appropriate*

management practices, ensure the permanent storage of atmospheric or biogenic carbon for several centuries through geological storage, such as bioenergy with carbon capture and storage and direct air carbon capture and storage, or through permanently bound carbon mineralisation, should be considered permanent carbon removals. Activities related to land management in the subcategories of the land use, land use change and forestry (LULUCF) sector covered by Article 2(1) of Regulation (EU) 2018/841 or related to coastal management, that result in carbon sequestration, or activities that result in biogenic emission reductions, such as methane reductions from feed changes or manure management, or nitrous oxide reductions from fertiliser reductions or manure management, for a minimum period of at least five years, are considered carbon farming activities. Certain carbon farming activities, in particular peatland rewetting, can result in carbon sequestration once the peatland is fully restored, while reducing carbon emissions through well-managed restoration and rewetting in an initial phase. Certain other activities, such as those based on the use of biochar, can be categorised under different types of activities depending on the specific conditions under which the activities take place. In light of the uncertainties in the measuring and monitoring methodologies related to many potential applications of carbon storage in products in early development stages, the certification of carbon storage in products should initially be limited to harvested wood products or materials for construction storing atmospheric and biogenic carbon stored for at least five decades and should be based on the report to be presented by the Commission in accordance with Article 17(3) Regulation (EU) 2018/841, while the possible benefits and trade-offs of the inclusion of other long-lived carbon storage products should be assessed by the

Compromise Amendment	3	Article 2(c), (d), (e), (f), (j), (k), (l), (m), (n), Recital 5 (Other definitions)
Compromise amendment replacing Amendments 36; 375-379; 382-398; 410; 427; 439-442; 465; 553; AGRI 37-39; AGRI 44; AGRI 46		

Proposal for a regulation
Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point c

Text proposed by the Commission

(c) ‘biogenic carbon pool’ means **above-ground biomass, below-ground biomass, litter, dead wood and soil organic carbon** as set out in points (a) to (e) of Part B of Annex I to Regulation 2018/841;

Amendment

(c) ‘biogenic carbon pool’ means **living** biomass, litter, dead wood, **dead organic matter, mineral soils and organic soils** as set out in points (a) to (f) of Part B of Annex I to Regulation 2018/841;

Proposal for a regulation
Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point d

Text proposed by the Commission

(d) ‘operator’ means any legal or physical person who operates or controls a carbon removal activity, or to whom decisive economic power over the technical functioning of the activity has been delegated;

Amendment

(d) ‘operator’ means any legal or **natural** person who operates or controls a **an** activity, **including public entities and public authorities**, or to whom decisive economic power over the technical functioning of the activity has been delegated; **in the case of a carbon farming activity, an operator is a farmer as defined in Article 3(1) of Regulation 22215/2021 or a forest owner or manager as defined by national legislation, or a public entity or public authority;**

Proposal for a regulation
Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point e

Text proposed by the Commission

(e) ‘group of operators’ means a legal entity that represents more than one

Amendment

(e) ‘group of operators’ means a legal entity that represents more than one

operator and is responsible for ensuring that those operators comply with this Regulation;

operator and is responsible for ensuring that those operators comply with this Regulation; ***in the case of a carbon farming activity, ‘group of operators’ means a cooperative or a legal entity that represents more than one farmer, forest owner or manager, or public entities or public authorities, or producer organisations or producer groups;***

Proposal for a regulation

Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point f

Text proposed by the Commission

(f) ‘monitoring period’ means a period, the duration of which is determined ***in accordance to the*** type of ***carbon removal*** activity, over which the storage of carbon is monitored by the operator;

Amendment

(f) ‘monitoring period’ means a period, the duration of which is determined ***for each*** type of activity in accordance ***with Article 6***, over which the storage of carbon is monitored by the operator ***or group of operators and during which the operator remains liable;***

Proposal for a regulation

Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point k

Text proposed by the Commission

(k) ‘certification scheme’ means a scheme managed by a private or public organisation that oversees the certification of compliance of operators or group of operators with this Regulation;

Amendment

(k) ‘certification scheme’ means a scheme managed by a private or public organisation that oversees the certification of compliance of operators or group of operators with this Regulation;

Proposal for a regulation

Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point n

Text proposed by the Commission

(n) ‘certificate’ means a conformity statement issued by the certification body certifying that the ***carbon removal*** activity complies with this Regulation;

Amendment

(n) ‘certificate’ means a conformity statement issued by the certification body certifying that the activity complies with this Regulation;

Proposal for a regulation
Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point o a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(oa) ‘reversal’ means the voluntary or involuntary release of carbon back into the atmosphere; and in the case of geological storage, ‘has the same meaning as leakage as defined under Directive 2009/31/EC or during CO2 transportation;

<p>Compromise Amendment 4 Article 3 and Recital 6 (Eligibility) Compromise amendment replacing Amendments 37; 466-477; AGRI 49-50 and corresponding Amendments 11; 145-153; AGRI 7 to Recitals</p>

Proposal for a regulation
Article 3 – paragraph 1 – introductory part

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Carbon removals shall be eligible for certification under this Regulation where they meet both of the following conditions:

Carbon removals, ***carbon farming or carbon storage in products*** shall be eligible for certification under this Regulation where they meet both of the following conditions:

Proposal for a regulation
Article 3 – paragraph 1 – point a

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(a) they are generated from a carbon removal activity that complies with the quality criteria set out in Articles 4 to 7;

(a) they ***comply*** with the quality criteria set out in Articles 4 to 7;

Proposal for a regulation
Article 3 – paragraph 1 – point a a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(aa) *they comply with the rules on use set out in Article 3a;*

Proposal for a regulation
Article 3 – paragraph 1 – point b

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(b) they are independently verified in accordance with Article 9.

(b) they are independently verified in accordance with Article 9.

Proposal for a regulation
Recital 6

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(6) This Regulation should set out the requirements under which carbon removals should be eligible for certification under the Union certification framework. To this end, carbon removals should be quantified in an accurate and robust way; and they should be generated only by **carbon removal** activities that generate a net **carbon removal** benefit, are additional, **aim to** ensure long-term storage of carbon, and have a neutral impact or co-benefit on sustainability objectives. Furthermore, **carbon removals** should be subject to independent third-party auditing in order to ensure the credibility and reliability of the certification process. Mandatory Union carbon pricing rules established through Directive 2003/87/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council²⁶ are in place which regulate the treatment of emissions from activities covered by that Directive. This Regulation should be without prejudice to Directive 2003/87/EC, except in relation to the certification of removals of emissions from sustainable biomass which are zero-rated in accordance with Annex IV thereto.

(6) This Regulation should set out the requirements under which carbon removals, **carbon farming or carbon storage in products** should be eligible for certification under the Union certification framework. To this end, **carbon removals, carbon farming sequestration, carbon farming emission reductions and carbon storage in products** should **comply with the criteria on issuance and use;** be quantified in an accurate and robust way; and they should be generated only by activities that generate a net benefit, are additional, ensure **permanent or** long-term **sequestration of carbon and/or the reduction of greenhouse gas emissions, and comply with the monitoring and liability requirements,** and have **at least** a neutral impact or co-benefit on sustainability objectives **in accordance with the requirements set out in this Regulation.** Furthermore, **activities** should be subject to independent third-party auditing in order to ensure the credibility and reliability of the certification process, **and should be publicly available through a Union registry.** Mandatory Union carbon pricing rules established through Directive 2003/87/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council²⁶ are in place which

regulate the treatment of emissions from activities covered by that Directive. This Regulation should be without prejudice to Directive 2003/87/EC, except in relation to the certification of removals of emissions from sustainable biomass which are zero-rated in accordance with Annex IV thereto.

²⁶ Directive 2003/87/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 13 October 2003 establishing a scheme for greenhouse gas emission allowance trading within the Community and amending Council Directive 96/61/EC (OJ L 275, 25.10.2003, p. 32).

²⁶ Directive 2003/87/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 13 October 2003 establishing a scheme for greenhouse gas emission allowance trading within the Community and amending Council Directive 96/61/EC (OJ L 275, 25.10.2003, p. 32).

Or. en

<p>Compromise Amendment 5 Article 18, Recital 30 (Review clause) Compromise amendment replacing Amendments 865-868, 871-872; AGRI 108; ITRE 49-50 and corresponding amendments to recitals 303-306; ITRE 1; ITRE; 3; ITRE 29</p>

Proposal for a regulation
Article 18 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

1. This Regulation shall be kept under review in all aspects, taking into account the relevant developments concerning Union legislation, United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change and the Paris Agreement, technological and scientific progress, market developments in the field of carbon removals, and Union food security.

Amendment

1. This Regulation shall be kept under review in all aspects, taking into account the relevant developments concerning Union legislation, United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change and the Paris Agreement, technological and scientific progress, market developments in the field of carbon removals, and Union food security.

Proposal for a regulation
Article 18 – paragraph 2

Text proposed by the Commission

2. Three years after the entry into force of this Regulation and not later than by the end of 2028, and subsequently within six

Amendment

2. Three years after the entry into force of this Regulation and not later than by the end of 2028, and subsequently within six

months after the outcome of each global stocktake agreed under Article 14 of the Paris Agreement, the Commission shall report to the European Parliament and to the Council on the implementation of this Regulation.

months after the outcome of each global stocktake agreed under Article 14 of the Paris Agreement, the Commission shall report to the European Parliament and to the Council on the implementation of this Regulation.

Proposal for a regulation

Recital 30

Text proposed by the Commission

(30) The Commission should review the implementation of this Regulation 3 years following the entry into force of this Regulation, and subsequently not later than six months after the global stocktake agreed under Article 14 of the Paris Agreement.. Those reviews should take into account the relevant developments concerning the Union legislation, technological and scientific progress, market developments in the field of carbon removals and food security including food availability and affordability, and should be informed by the results of the global stocktake of the Paris Agreement.

Amendment

(30) The Commission should review the implementation of this Regulation 3 years following the entry into force of this Regulation, and subsequently not later than six months after the global stocktake agreed under Article 14 of the Paris Agreement.. Those reviews should take into account the relevant developments concerning the Union legislation, technological and scientific progress, market developments in the field of carbon removals, ***carbon farming and carbon storage in products***, and food security including food availability and affordability, and should be informed by the results of the global stocktake of the Paris Agreement.



2022/0394(COD)

11.10.2023

COMPROMISE AMENDMENT 6

BLOCK 2 (Articles 3a (new) and 18 on use)

Draft report

Lídia Pereira

(PE745.292v02-00)

Establishing a Union certification framework for carbon removals

Proposal for a regulation

(COM(2022)0672 – C9-0399/2022 – 2022/0394(COD))

Compromise Amendment 6 Article 3a (new), recitals (new) (Use)
Compromise amendment replacing Amendments 66; 268-269; 350-352; 355; 541-542; 674; 723; 767; 849; 854-852; 864; 869-870; 873-875; AGRI 31; AGRI 33; AGRI 106-107 and corresponding Amendments 21-22; 91; 129; 259-270; ITRE 8; ITRE 20; ITRE 26; AGRI 23 to recitals

Proposal for a regulation
Article 3 a (new) - paragraphs 1 to 3

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Article 3a

Rules on the issuance and use of units

1. Carbon farming sequestration and emission reduction units shall be issued by 31 December each year, provided that an annual monitoring check does not show any non-compliance with the requirements set out in this Regulation and does not show a reversal. The certification body shall be responsible for the annual monitoring check based on reliable real-world data, which may be provided by a legal person or relevant authority, such as the paying agency, with the aid of the identification system for agricultural parcels provided for in Article 68 of Regulation (EU) 2116/2021). The annual monitoring check shall be performed by 15 October each year. The certification body shall transmit data on any non-compliance or reversal to the certification scheme within one month of the monitoring check.

1. Any use of units shall ensure the highest integrity of climate mitigation and shall lead to an overall lower concentration of greenhouse gases in the atmosphere. All removals, sequestration and emission reductions generated under this Regulation shall contribute to achieving the Union's NDCs and climate targets and objectives as set out in the

European Climate Law and shall not contribute to a third country's NDC.

2. A certified unit shall not be used or claimed by more than one legal or natural person at any point in time, and shall not be counted towards more than one Member State's greenhouse gas inventory at any point in time;

3. Carbon removal units, carbon farming sequestration units, carbon farming emission reduction units and carbon storage in product units shall remain distinct from each other.

[...]

**Proposal for a regulation
Article 3 a (new) - paragraph 4**

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Article 3a

Rules on the issuance and use of units

[...]

4. The use of units certified under this Regulation by an undertaking for voluntary compensation, offset or reduction claims in its corporate greenhouse gas inventory reporting shall be subject to the same conditions as those laid down for the use of units for corporate business-to-consumer commercial practices in Directive 2005/29/EC as amended by Directive (EU) .../... of the European Parliament and of the Council [Empowering Consumers for the Green Transition]. The Commission is empowered to adopt delegated acts in accordance with Article 16 to establish the details of this provision.

**Proposal for a regulation
Article 18 – paragraph 2 c (new)**

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

2c. *The Commission shall examine options to increase emission reductions within the food supply chain, including options related to the use of carbon farming units, and shall, where appropriate, no later than ... [OJ: please insert the date 12 months from the entry into force of this Regulation] present a legislative proposal accompanied by an impact assessment to that end.*

**Proposal for a regulation
Article 18 – paragraph 2 b (new)**

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

2b. *No later than ... [OJ: insert the date 12 months from the entry into force of this Regulation], the Commission shall report to the European Parliament and to the Council, accompanied, where appropriate, by a legislative proposal and impact assessment, on the establishment of Union targets for permanent carbon removals and for land-based sequestration as an integral part of the post-2030 EU climate framework.*

**Proposal for a regulation
Article 3 a (new) - paragraph 5**

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Article 3a

Rules on the issuance and use of units

[...]

5. In accordance with the review clause set out in Article 30(5) of Directive 2003/87/EC, by 31 July 2026, the Commission shall report to the European Parliament and to the Council, accompanied, where appropriate, by a legislative proposal and impact

assessment, on how negative emissions resulting from greenhouse gases that are removed from the atmosphere and safely and permanently stored could be accounted for and how those negative emissions could be covered by emissions trading, if appropriate, including a clear scope and strict criteria for such coverage, and safeguards to ensure that such removals do not offset necessary emission reductions in accordance with Union climate targets laid down in Regulation (EU) 2021/1119;

Proposal for a regulation
Recital 20 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(20a) All removals, sequestration and biogenic emission reductions generated under this Regulation should contribute to achieving the Union’s NDCs or climate targets and objectives. However, in order to avoid double counting, a certified unit should not be used or claimed by more than one natural or legal person, such as undertakings or public authorities other than a Member State, like city councils or communes, at any point in time, and should not be counted towards more than one Member State’s greenhouse gas inventories at any point in time.

Amendment 22

Proposal for a regulation
Recital 21

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(21) It is appropriate that carbon removal certificates underpin different end-uses, such as the compilation of national and corporate greenhouse gas inventories, including with regard to Regulation (EU) 2018/841 of the European

(21) The different end-uses of certified units, such as the compilation of national and corporate greenhouse gas inventories, including with regard to Regulation (EU) 2018/841 of the European Parliament and of the Council³¹, the proof of climate-

Parliament and of the Council³¹, the proof of climate-related and other environmental corporate claims (including on biodiversity), or the exchange of verified *carbon removal* units through voluntary *carbon offsetting* markets. To this end, the certificate should contain accurate and transparent information on the *carbon removal* activity, including the total removals and net *carbon removal* benefit that comply with the quality criteria set out in this Regulation. The Commission should be also empowered to adopt delegated acts to further specify or amend Annex II which lists the minimum information to be contained in the certificates.

related and other environmental corporate claims (including on biodiversity), or the exchange of verified units through voluntary markets, ***should be regulated through this Regulation. The use of units certified under this Regulation by an undertaking for voluntary compensation, offset or reduction claims in its corporate greenhouse gas inventory reporting should be the same as set in the Directive (EU).../... of the European Parliament and of the Council [Empowering Consumers for the Green Transition], which prohibits the use of certified units for claiming that, based on greenhouse gas emissions offsetting, a product or a company has a neutral, reduced or positive impact on the environment in terms of greenhouse gas emissions. In addition, for the possible future use of certified units towards the compliance with the Union and national climate framework, the Commission should no later than 12 months after the entry into force of this Regulation assess and, where appropriate, present a legislative proposal on the establishment of Union targets for permanent carbon removals and for land-based sequestration, and should, in accordance with Directive 2003/87/EC, by 31 July 2026 assess how permanent carbon storage could be accounted for and how those negative emissions could be covered by emissions trading, and, where appropriate, present a legislative proposal in that regard.*** To this end, *carbon removal units, carbon farming sequestration units, carbon farming emission reduction units and carbon storage in product units should remain distinct from each other and* the certificate should contain accurate and transparent information on the activity, including ***the type of activity, the storage medium and expected duration of the results,*** the total removals, ***sequestration or biogenic emission reductions, as appropriate, the net benefit, the detailed liability mechanism and liable legal or physical person, evidence that the activity meets***

the sustainability objectives and the quantity of units certified that comply with the quality criteria set out in this Regulation. The Commission should be also empowered to adopt delegated acts to further specify or amend Annex II which lists the minimum information to be contained in the certificates.

³¹ Regulation (EU) 2018/841 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 30 May 2018 on the inclusion of greenhouse gas emissions and removals from land use, land use change and forestry in the 2030 climate and energy framework, and amending Regulation (EU) No 525/2013 and Decision No 529/2013/EU (OJ L 156, 19.6.2018, p. 1).

³¹ Regulation (EU) 2018/841 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 30 May 2018 on the inclusion of greenhouse gas emissions and removals from land use, land use change and forestry in the 2030 climate and energy framework, and amending Regulation (EU) No 525/2013 and Decision No 529/2013/EU (OJ L 156, 19.6.2018, p. 1).

^{31a} ***Directive (EU) 2022/2464 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 14 December 2022 amending Regulation (EU) No 537/2014, Directive 2004/109/EC, Directive 2006/43/EC and Directive 2013/34/EU, as regards corporate sustainability reporting (OJ L 322, 16.12.2022, p. 15).***

^{31b} ***Regulation (EU) 2018/842 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 30 May 2018 on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to 2030 contributing to climate action to meet commitments under the Paris Agreement and amending Regulation (EU) No 525/2013 (OJ L 156, 19.6.2018, p. 26).***



2022/0394(COD)

11.10.2023

COMPROMISE AMENDMENTS 7 - 11 and 20

BLOCK 3 (Articles 4-8, 15 and Annex I and II)

Draft report
Lídia Pereira
(PE745.292v02-00)

Establishing a Union certification framework for carbon removals

Proposal for a regulation
(COM(2022)0672 – C9-0399/2022 – 2022/0394(COD))

Compromise Amendment 7 Article 4, Recitals 7-10 (Quantification)
 Compromise amendment replacing Amendments 39-43; 437; 485-521; 523; 525-538; 543-552; 554-556; 586; AGRI 51-61; AGRI 63-65; AGRI 67-68; ITRE 36 and corresponding Amendments 12-14; 154-163; 165-186; 207; 242; AGRI 9-11; ITRE 14 to Recitals

Proposal for a regulation
Article 4 – paragraph 1 – introductory part

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

1. A carbon removal activity shall provide a net carbon removal benefit, which shall be quantified using the following formula:

1. A carbon removal activity shall provide a net carbon removal benefit, which shall be quantified using the formula:

Proposal for a regulation
Article 4 – paragraph 1 – subparagraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Net carbon removal benefit = $CR_{\text{baseline}} - CR_{\text{total}} - \mathbf{GHG}_{\text{increase}} > 0$

Net carbon removal benefit = $CR_{\text{baseline}} - CR_{\text{total}} - \mathbf{GHG}_{\text{associated}} > 0$

Proposal for a regulation
Article 4 – paragraph 1 – subparagraph 2 – point a

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(a) CR_{baseline} is the carbon removals under the baseline;

(a) CR_{baseline} is the carbon removals under the baseline;

Proposal for a regulation
Article 4 – paragraph 1 – subparagraph 2 – point b

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(b) CR_{total} is the total carbon removals of the carbon removal activity;

(b) CR_{total} is the total carbon removals of the carbon removal activity;

Proposal for a regulation

Article 4 – paragraph 1 – subparagraph 2 – point c

Text proposed by the Commission

(c) $GHG_{increase}$ is the increase in direct and indirect greenhouse gas emissions, ***other than those from biogenic carbon pools in the case of carbon farming***, which are due to the implementation of the carbon removal activity.

Amendment

(c) $GHG_{associated}$ is the increase in direct and indirect greenhouse gas emissions, ***over the entire life cycle of the activity*** which are due to the implementation of the carbon removal activity, ***calculated in accordance with protocols set forth in the 2006 IPCC Guidelines for National Greenhouse Gas Inventories. This includes, among others, emissions due to energy use, transportation, material inputs, displacement effects due to competing demand for energy or waste heat, and direct and indirect land use change, and covers both impacts within and outside the Union. The certification of a carbon removal activity based on the storage of carbon dioxide from sustainable biomass shall not lead to an increase of the capacity of the plant beyond what is necessary for the functioning of the CCS.***

Proposal for a regulation

Article 4 – paragraph 2

Text proposed by the Commission

2. ***In the case of carbon farming, $CR_{baseline}$ and CR_{total} shall be understood as net greenhouse gas removals or emissions in accordance with the accounting rules laid down in Regulation (EU) 2018/841.***

Amendment

2. ***A carbon farming activity shall provide net benefits, which shall be quantified using the following formulas:***

Net carbon farming sequestration benefit
= $(CS_{baseline} - CS_{total}) - GHG_{associated} > 0$,
where:

(a) $CS_{baseline}$ is the carbon sequestration under the baseline,

(b) CS_{total} is the total carbon sequestration of the carbon farming activity,

(c) $GHG_{associated}$ is the direct and indirect greenhouse gas emissions over the entire

life cycle of the activity, which are due to the implementation of the carbon farming activity. This includes, among others, emissions due to energy use, transportation, material inputs, and direct and indirect land use change, and covers both impacts within and outside the Union.

Net carbon farming carbon reduction benefit = $(RC_{baseline} - RC_{total} - GHG_{associated}) > 0$

Net carbon farming nitrogen reduction benefit = $(N2O_{baseline} - N2O_{total} - GHG_{associated}) > 0$

Net carbon farming methane reduction benefit = $(CH4_{baseline} - CH4_{total} - GHG_{associated}) > 0$

, where:

(a) $RC_{baseline}$ is the carbon emissions under the baseline;

(b) RC_{total} is the total reduction in carbon emissions achieved through the implementation of the carbon farming activity,

(c) $GHG_{associated}$ is the direct and indirect greenhouse gas emissions over the entire life cycle of the activity, which are due to the implementation of the carbon farming activity. This includes, among others, emissions due to energy use, transportation, material inputs, and direct and indirect land use change, and covers both impacts within and outside the Union;

(d) $N2O_{baseline}$ is the $N2O$ emissions under the baseline due to the use of fertiliser or manure;

(e) $N2O_{total}$ is the total reduction in $N2O$ emissions due to the use of fertiliser or manure management that is directly attributable to the activity;

(f) $CH4_{baseline}$ is the $CH4$ emissions under the baseline due to enteric fermentation or manure management;

(g) $CH4_{total}$ is the total reduction in $CH4$

emissions due to enteric fermentation or manure management that is directly attributable to the activity;

Where the activity generates both carbon farming sequestration and carbon farming emission reductions, the registry referred to in Article 12 shall ensure that a distinction is made between the corresponding carbon farming sequestration units and carbon farming emission reduction units.

In the case of carbon farming, the scope of the quantities referred to in $CS_{baseline}$ and CS_{total} corresponds to the net greenhouse gas removals included in the scope of Regulation 2018/841, and the scope of the quantities referred to in $RC_{baseline}$ and RC_{total} corresponds to the net greenhouse gas emissions from biogenic carbon pools as set out in points (e) to (f) of Section B of Annex I to Regulation 2018/841.

The scope of the quantities referred to in $N2O_{baseline}$ and $N2O_{total}$ corresponds to the greenhouse gas emissions from the IPCC source category 4B 10 – 12 (manure management) and 4D (agricultural soils).

[The scope of the quantities referred to in $CH4_{baseline}$ and $CH4_{total}$ corresponds to the greenhouse gas emissions from the IPCC source categories 4A (enteric fermentation) and 4B 1 - 9 (manure management).

**Proposal for a regulation
Article 4 – paragraph 2a**

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

2a. A carbon storage in products activity shall provide a net carbon storage in products benefit, which shall be quantified using the formula:

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Net carbon product sequestration benefit

$$= CPS_{baseline} - CPS_{total} - GHG_{associated} > 0$$

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(a) *CPS_{baseline} is the carbon sequestered in a product under the baseline;*

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(b) *CPS_{total} is the total carbon sequestered in the product of the activity;*

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(c) *GHG_{associated} is the increase in direct and indirect greenhouse gas emissions, over the entire life cycle of the activity which are due to the implementation of the carbon removal activity. This includes, among others, emissions due to energy use, transportation, material inputs, displacement effects due to competing demand for energy or waste heat, and direct and indirect land use change, and covers both impacts within and outside the Union.*

Proposal for a regulation

Article 4 – paragraph 3

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

3. Quantities referred to in paragraph 1, points (a), (b) and (c), shall be designated with a negative sign (-) if they are net greenhouse gas removals and with a positive sign (+) if they are net greenhouse gas emissions ; they shall be expressed in tonnes of carbon dioxide equivalent.

3. Quantities referred to in paragraph 1 points (a), (b) and (c), ***in paragraph 2 points (a), (b), (c), (d) and (e), (f) and (g) and in paragraph 2a points (a), (b) and (c)*** shall be designated with a negative sign (-) if they are net greenhouse gas removals ***or, in the case of carbon farming emission reductions, net greenhouse gas reductions,*** and with a positive sign (+) if they are net greenhouse gas emissions, they

shall be expressed in tonnes of carbon dioxide equivalent.

Proposal for a regulation
Article 4 – paragraph 4

Text proposed by the Commission

4. Carbon removals shall be quantified in a relevant, accurate, complete, consistent, comparable and transparent manner.

Amendment

4. Carbon removals, ***carbon farming and carbon storage in products*** shall be quantified in a relevant, accurate, complete, consistent, comparable and transparent manner. ***Uncertainties in the quantification of carbon removals shall be duly reported and accounted as part of the certification methodologies, in a manner that is conservative, proportionate to the level of uncertainty, in accordance with recognised statistical approaches and with the latest available scientific evidence .***

Proposal for a regulation
Article 4 – paragraph 5

Text proposed by the Commission

5. The baseline shall correspond to the standard ***carbon removal*** performance of comparable activities in similar social, economic, environmental and technological circumstances and take into account the geographical context.

Amendment

5. ***In the case of carbon removals or carbon storage in products,*** the ***standardised*** baseline shall ***be representative of the state-of-the-art performance of common current practices*** of comparable activities in similar social, economic, environmental and technological circumstances and take into account the geographical context.

Proposal for a regulation
Article 4 – paragraph 5a

Text proposed by the Commission

5a. In the case of carbon farming, the standardised baseline shall be representative of the performance of common current practices of comparable activities in similar social, economic, environmental and technological circumstances and take into account the

geographical context. In the case of carbon farming sequestration, the calculation of the standardised baseline shall not take into account those common current practices of comparable carbon farming sequestration activities that result in net greenhouse gas emissions. In the case of carbon farming emission reduction, the calculation of the standardised baseline shall not take into account those common current practices of comparable carbon farming emission reduction activities that result in increased net greenhouse gas emissions. The respective methodologies shall differentiate between static or dynamic baselines where necessary.

Proposal for a regulation
Article 4 – paragraph 6

Text proposed by the Commission

6. By way of derogation from paragraph 5, where duly justified, the baseline may be based on the individual **carbon removal** performance of that activity.

Amendment

6. By way of derogation from paragraph 5, where duly justified **in the applicable certification methodology by the absence of sufficient comparable activities to be able to set a representative baseline**, the baseline may be based on the individual performance of that activity **at the start of that activity**.

Proposal for a regulation
Article 4 – paragraph 7

Text proposed by the Commission

7. The baseline shall be **periodically** updated.

Amendment

7. The baseline shall be **regularly reviewed and updated by the Commission at least every five years. The baseline shall remain constant for the operator throughout the monitoring period once an activity has started, but shall be reviewed and updated upon re-certification.**

Proposal for a regulation
Article 4 – paragraph 8

Text proposed by the Commission

8. The quantification of the carbon removals shall account for uncertainties in accordance with recognised statistical approaches.

Amendment

deleted

Proposal for a regulation
Article 4 – paragraph 9

Text proposed by the Commission

9. To support the quantification of **carbon removals generated by** carbon farming, the operator or group of operators shall gather data on carbon **removals** and greenhouse gas emissions in a manner compatible with national greenhouse gas inventories under Regulation (EU) 2018/841 and Part 3 of Annex V to Regulation (EU) 2018/1999.

Amendment

9. To support the quantification of carbon farming, the operator or group of operators shall gather data on carbon **sequestration** and greenhouse gas emissions **based on the use of Tier 3 methodologies in accordance with the 2006 IPCC guidelines for national GHG inventories, and** in a manner compatible with national greenhouse gas inventories under Regulation (EU) 2018/841 and Part 3 of Annex V to Regulation (EU) 2018/1999, **taking into account the objective of minimising burden for small-scale operators in accordance with Article 8.3.**

Proposal for a regulation
Recital 7

Text proposed by the Commission

(7) **A carbon removal** activity should result in a net **carbon removal** benefit showing that it delivers a positive climate impact. The net **carbon removal** benefit should be computed following two steps. First, operators should quantify the amount of additional carbon removals that **a carbon removal** activity has generated in comparison to a baseline. A standardised baseline reflecting the standard

Amendment

(7) **An** activity should result in a net benefit showing that it delivers a positive climate impact. The **calculation of the net benefit should be differentiated for permanent carbon removals, carbon farming sequestration, carbon farming carbon, nitrogen or methane emission reductions and carbon storage in products in order to take into account their fundamentally different characteristics,**

performance of comparable activities in similar social, economic, environmental and technological circumstances and geographical locations should be preferred because it ensures objectivity, minimises compliance and other administrative costs, and positively recognises the action of first movers who have already engaged in carbon removal activities. In the context of carbon farming, the use of available digital technologies, including electronic databases and geographic information systems, remote sensing, artificial intelligence and machine learning, and of electronic maps should be promoted to decrease the costs of establishing baselines and of monitoring *carbon removal* activities. However, where it is not possible to set such a standardised baseline, a project-specific baseline based on the operator's individual performance may be used. In order to reflect the social, economic, environmental and technological developments and to encourage ambition over time in line with the Paris Agreement, baselines should be *periodically* updated.

and should be computed following two steps. First, operators should quantify, *as applicable*, the amount of additional carbon removals *in the case of carbon removal activities, the amount of additional carbon sequestration in the case of carbon farming sequestration activities or carbon storage in product activities, or the amount of additional biogenic emission reductions in the case of carbon farming emission reductions*, that *an* activity has generated in comparison to a baseline. A standardised baseline *should be representative of the performance of common current practices of* comparable activities in similar social, economic, environmental and technological circumstances and geographical locations should be preferred because it ensures objectivity, minimises compliance and other administrative costs, and positively recognises the action of first movers who have already engaged in carbon removal activities. *In order to ensure the climate integrity of the framework, in the case of permanent carbon removals the standardised baseline should be representative of state-of-the-art of comparable activities, and in the case of carbon farming activities, the calculation of a standardised baseline should exclude existing activities which have been identified as in the case of carbon farming sequestration, not representing genuine sequestrations and instead resulted in net greenhouse gas emissions, and, in the case of carbon farming emission reductions, not representing genuine reductions and instead resulted in more rather than less emissions.* In the context of carbon farming, the use of available digital technologies, including electronic databases and geographic information systems, remote sensing, *novel in-field carbon quantification systems*, artificial intelligence and machine learning, and of electronic maps should be promoted to decrease the costs of establishing baselines and of monitoring activities. However,

where it is not possible to set such a standardised baseline, a project-specific baseline based on the operator's individual performance may be used. In order to reflect the social, economic, environmental and technological developments and to encourage ambition over time in line with the Paris Agreement, baselines should be **regularly reviewed by the Commission and updated at least every five years. However, in order to ensure a stable operational and investment environment for operators, once an activity has started, the baseline should remain constant for the operator for that activity throughout the monitoring period, and should be reviewed and updated only upon re-certification.**

Proposal for a regulation

Recital 8

Text proposed by the Commission

(8) The second step for quantifying the net **carbon removal** benefit should consist of subtracting any increase in greenhouse gas emissions related to the implementation of the carbon removal activity. Relevant greenhouse gas emissions that should be taken into consideration include direct emissions, such as those resulting from the use of more fertilisers, fuel or energy, or indirect emissions, such as those resulting from land use change, with consequent risks for food security due to displacement of agricultural production. ***A reduction in greenhouse gas emissions resulting from the implementation of the carbon removal activity should not be taken into account to quantify the net carbon removal benefit, but should be considered as a co-benefit towards the sustainability objective of climate change mitigation; by being reported on the certificates, decreases in greenhouse gas emissions (like the other sustainability co-benefits) can increase***

Amendment

(8) The second step for quantifying the net benefit should consist of subtracting any increase in greenhouse gas emissions related to the ***entire life cycle of the*** implementation of the activity. Relevant greenhouse gas emissions that should be taken into consideration include direct emissions, such as those resulting from the use of more fertilisers, ***chemicals***, fuel or energy, or indirect emissions, such as those resulting from ***transportation, material inputs, displacement effects due to competing demand for energy or waste heat, or direct and indirect*** land use change with consequent risks for food security due to displacement of agricultural production, ***and should cover both the impacts within and outside the Union.***

the value of the certified carbon removals.

Proposal for a regulation

Recital 9

Text proposed by the Commission

(9) *A carbon removal* activity delivers a net **carbon removal** benefit when the carbon removals above the baseline outweigh any increase in greenhouse gas emissions due to the implementation of the **carbon removal** activity. For instance, in the case of activities that deliver permanent carbon storage by injecting carbon underground, the amount of permanently stored carbon should outweigh the energy-related greenhouse gas emissions from the industrial process. In the case of carbon farming, the carbon captured by an afforestation activity or the carbon kept in the ground by a peatland re-wetting activity should outweigh the emissions from the machinery used to carry out the **carbon removal** activity or the indirect land use change emissions that can be caused by carbon leakage.

Amendment

(9) *An* activity delivers a net benefit when, **respectively**, the carbon removals, **the carbon sequestration or the emission reductions** above the baseline outweigh any increase in greenhouse gas emissions due to the implementation of the activity. For instance, in the case of activities that deliver permanent carbon storage by injecting carbon underground, the amount of permanently stored carbon should outweigh the energy-related greenhouse gas emissions from the industrial process **during capture, transport and storage as well as the displacement effects due to competing demand for energy or waste heat**. In the case of carbon farming **sequestration**, the carbon captured **and sequestered** by an afforestation activity or the carbon kept in the ground by a peatland re-wetting activity should outweigh the emissions from the machinery used to carry out the activity or the indirect land use change emissions that can be caused by carbon leakage. **In the case of carbon farming emission reductions, the carbon emissions reduced by a peatland re-wetting activity should outweigh the emissions from the machinery used to carry out the activity or the indirect land use change emissions that can be caused by carbon leakage.**

Proposal for a regulation

Recital 10

Text proposed by the Commission

(10) **Carbon removals** should be quantified in a relevant, accurate, complete, consistent and comparable

Amendment

(10) **Activities** should be quantified in a relevant, accurate, complete, consistent, comparable **and transparent** manner.

manner. Uncertainties in the quantification should be duly reported and accounted in order to limit the risk of overestimating the quantity of carbon dioxide removed from the atmosphere. Carbon *removals* generated by carbon farming should be quantified with a high level of accuracy to assure the highest quality and minimise uncertainties. Moreover, in order to incentivise synergies between Union climate and biodiversity objectives, enhanced monitoring of land needs to be required, thereby helping to protect and enhance the resilience of nature-based *carbon removals* throughout the Union. The satellite and on-site monitoring and reporting of emissions and removals need to closely reflect those approaches, and make the best use of advanced technologies available under Union programmes, such as Copernicus, making full use of already existing tools, and ensure consistency with the national greenhouse gas inventories.

Uncertainties in the quantification should be duly reported and accounted *as part of the certification methodologies, in a manner that is conservative, proportionate to the level of uncertainty, in accordance with recognised statistical approaches and with the latest available scientific evidence*, in order to limit the risk of overestimating the quantity of carbon dioxide removed from the atmosphere. Carbon *sequestration and emission reductions* generated by carbon farming should be quantified with a high level of accuracy to assure the highest quality and minimise uncertainties, *based on the use of Tier 3 methodologies in accordance with the 2006 IPCC guidelines for national GHG inventories*. Moreover, in order to incentivise synergies between Union climate and biodiversity objectives, enhanced monitoring of land needs to be required, thereby helping to protect and enhance the resilience of nature-based *sinks* throughout the Union. The satellite and on-site monitoring and reporting of emissions and removals need to closely reflect those approaches, and make the best use of advanced technologies available under Union programmes, such as Copernicus, making full use of already existing tools, and ensure consistency with the national greenhouse gas inventories.

Compromise Amendment 8 Article 5, Recitals 11-12 (Additionality)
 Compromise amendment replacing Amendments 44-46; 557-576; 581-585; 724; AGRI 69-71 and corresponding Amendments 15-16; 187-197; ITRE 6; AGRI 13-14 to Recitals

Proposal for a regulation
Article 5 – paragraph 1 – introductory part

Text proposed by the Commission

1. *A carbon removal* activity shall be additional. To that end, the *carbon removal* activity shall meet both of the

Amendment

1. *Each* activity shall be additional. To that end, the activity shall meet both of

following criteria:

the following criteria:

Proposal for a regulation
Article 5 – paragraph 1 – point a

Text proposed by the Commission

(a) it goes beyond Union and national statutory requirements;

Amendment

(a) it goes beyond Union and national statutory requirements ***at the level of the individual operator.***

Proposal for a regulation
Article 5 – paragraph 1 – point b

Text proposed by the Commission

(b) it takes place due to the incentive effect of the certification.

Amendment

(b) the incentive effect of the certification ***is needed for the activity to become financially attractive.***

Proposal for a regulation
Article 5 – paragraph 2

Text proposed by the Commission

(2) Where the baseline is established pursuant to Article 4(5), additionality as referred to in paragraph 1 is considered to be complied with. Where the baseline is established pursuant to Article 4(6), additionality as referred to in paragraph 1, points (a) and (b), shall be demonstrated through specific tests.

Amendment

(2) Where the baseline is established pursuant to Article 4(5) ***or 4(5a)***, additionality as referred to in paragraph 1a is considered to be complied with. Where the baseline is established pursuant to Article 4(6), additionality as referred to in paragraph 1, points (a) and (b), shall be demonstrated through specific tests ***set out as part of the certification methodologies referred to in Article 8.***

Proposal for a regulation
Recital 11

Text proposed by the Commission

(11) In order to ensure that the Union certification framework channels incentives toward ***carbon removals*** that go beyond the standard practice, ***carbon removal*** activities should be additional.

Amendment

(11) In order to ensure that the Union certification framework channels incentives toward ***activities*** that go beyond the standard practice, activities should be additional. Therefore, these activities

Therefore, these activities should go beyond statutory requirements, that is, operators should carry out activities that are not already imposed upon them by the applicable law. Moreover, **carbon removal** activities should take place due to the incentive effect provided by the certification. Such effect is present when the incentive created by the potential revenues, resulting from the certification, changes the behaviour of operators in such a way that they engage in the additional carbon removal activity to achieve additional **carbon removals**.

should go beyond statutory requirements **at the level of the individual operator**, that is, operators should carry out activities that are not already imposed upon them by the applicable law. **In the case of carbon farming, such statutory requirements include relevant statutory management requirements and GAEC standards established under Chapter I, Section 2 of Regulation (EU) 2021/2115 and relevant minimum requirements for the use of fertiliser and plant protection products, animal welfare, as well as other relevant mandatory requirements established by national and Union law, applicable at the level of the operator.** Moreover, activities should take place due to the incentive effect provided by the certification **making the activity financially attractive**. Such effect is present when the incentive created by the potential revenues, resulting from the certification, changes the behaviour of operators in such a way that they engage in the additional activity to achieve additional **net benefits**.

Proposal for a regulation

Recital 12

Text proposed by the Commission

(12) A standardised baseline should reflect the statutory and market conditions in which the **carbon removal** activity takes place. If **a carbon removal** activity is imposed upon operators by the applicable law, **or it does not need any incentives to take place**, its performance will be reflected in the baseline. For this reason, a **carbon removal** activity that generates **carbon removals** in excess of such a baseline should be presumed to be additional. Hence, the use of a standardised baseline should simplify the demonstration of additionality for operators. Therefore, it should reduce the administrative burden of the certification process, which is particularly important in the case of small-scale land managers.

Amendment

(12) A standardised baseline should reflect the statutory and market conditions in which the activity takes place. If **an** activity is imposed upon operators by the applicable law, its performance will be reflected in the baseline. For this reason, **an** activity that generates **net benefits** in excess of such a baseline should be presumed to be additional **to statutory requirements**. Hence, the use of a standardised baseline should simplify the demonstration of **regulatory** additionality for operators. Therefore, it should reduce the administrative burden of the certification process, which is particularly important in the case of small-scale land managers.

Compromise Amendment 9 Article 6, Recitals 13-14 (Monitoring, Liability, Expiry)

Compromise amendment replacing Amendments 48-56; 391-397; 587-626; 728-729; AGRI 72-76; ITRE 37-40 and corresponding Amendments 17-18; 198-206; 208-211; AGRI 15-16; ITRE 15

**Proposal for a regulation
Article 6 – title**

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Long-term storage

Storage **duration, monitoring and liability requirements**

**Proposal for a regulation
Article 6 – paragraph 1**

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

1. An operator or group of operators shall demonstrate that a carbon removal activity aims at ensuring the **long-term** storage of carbon.

1. An operator or group of operators shall **ensure and** demonstrate that a carbon removal activity **results in the permanent** storage of carbon.

1a. An operator or group of operators shall ensure and demonstrate that a carbon farming activity results in the long-term sequestration of carbon and/or the reduction of greenhouse gas emissions.

1b. An operator or group of operators shall ensure and demonstrate that a carbon storage in products activity results in the long-term storage of carbon.

**Proposal for a regulation
Article 6 – paragraph 2**

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

2. For the purposes of paragraph 1, an operator or group of operators shall comply with **both of** the following criteria:

(a) they shall monitor and mitigate

2. For the purposes of paragraph 1, **1a and 1b**, an operator or group of operators shall comply with the following criteria **set out in paragraphs 2a to 2d.**

any risk of release of the stored carbon occurring during the monitoring period;

(b) they shall be subject to appropriate liability mechanisms in order to address any release of the stored carbon occurring during the monitoring period.

2a. An operator or group of operators shall monitor and mitigate any risk of release of the stored carbon occurring during the monitoring period, which shall be set as follows:

(a) for carbon removal activities, the monitoring period and requirements shall be consistent with the provisions set out in Articles 13, 17 and 18 of Directive 2009/31/EC;

(b) for carbon farming activities, the monitoring period and requirements shall cover at least the entire duration over which the results of the activity are projected to be sustained as set out in the applicable certification methodology;

(c) for carbon storage in products activities, the monitoring period shall cover the entire lifetime of the product until and including the end of life of the product;

2aa. A carbon farming operator or group of operators may designate a legal person or relevant authority, such as the paying agency within the meaning of Article 9 of Regulation (EU) 2021/2116 in the case of carbon farming activities registered in the LPIS, to be responsible for the monitoring, subject to all requirements under this Regulation being met.

2b. An operator or group of operators shall be subject to appropriate liability mechanisms, and designate a liable physical or legal person to be responsible for addressing any reversal, including due to force majeure, at any point in time during the activity:

(a) for carbon removal activities, the liability mechanism shall be consistent with the liability mechanism set out in Directive 2009/31/EC;

(b) for carbon farming activities, the liability mechanism shall be set out and approved as part of the applicable certification methodology and ensure that equivalent carbon sequestration is generated as compensation for the

reversal;

(c) for carbon storage in products activities, the liability mechanism shall be set out and approved as part of the applicable certification methodology and ensure that equivalent carbon storage is generated as compensation for the reversal;

The certification scheme shall continuously monitor and ensure the availability and readiness of the liability mechanism throughout the monitoring period of an activity.

2c. In case of a reversal, the corresponding units shall be suspended in the certification registry where they are registered until the reversal has been addressed by the liability mechanism in accordance with paragraph 2b.

Where a reversal is not addressed within a reasonable timeframe through the liability mechanism in accordance with paragraph 2b, the validity of a certificate shall expire and the corresponding units shall be cancelled in the certification registry where they are registered;

2d. Where the validity of a certificate has expired in accordance with paragraph 2c, the operator or group of operators shall pay a corrective penalty reflecting the carbon cost of the amount of carbon released to the atmosphere. The Commission is empowered to adopt delegated acts in accordance with Article [...] to establish the formula for the calculation of the penalties and supplement this Regulation concerning the modalities for the payment of the penalties.

Proposal for a regulation
Article 6 – paragraph 3

Text proposed by the Commission

3. For carbon farming and carbon storage in products, ***the carbon stored by a***

Amendment

3. For carbon farming and carbon storage in products, ***the net benefit***

carbon removal activity shall be considered released to the atmosphere at the end of the monitoring period.

generated by the activity during the entire lifetime of the activity shall be considered released to the atmosphere at the end of the monitoring period *or in case the monitoring has been discontinued before the end of the monitoring period and the corresponding units shall be cancelled in the certification registry where they are registered, unless the operator or the group of operators carry out a re-certification of the activity and demonstrate the continuation of the activity and monitoring period*. However, a carbon farming activity shall not lead to a decreased carbon sink, as defined in Regulation (EU) 2018/841, compared to the baseline beyond the monitoring period.

Proposal for a regulation

Recital 13

Text proposed by the Commission

(13) Atmospheric and biogenic carbon that is captured and stored through *a carbon removal* activity risks being released back into the atmosphere (e.g. reversal) due to natural or anthropogenic causes. Therefore, operators should take all relevant preventive measures to mitigate those risks and duly monitor that carbon continues to be stored over the monitoring period laid down for the *relevant carbon removal* activity. The validity of the *certified carbon removals* should depend on the expected duration of the storage and the different risks of reversal associated with the given *carbon removal* activity. Activities that store carbon in geological formations provide enough certainties on the very long-term duration of several centuries for the stored carbon and can be considered as providing permanent storage of carbon. Carbon farming or carbon storage in products are more exposed to the risk of voluntary or involuntary release of carbon into the atmosphere. To account for

Amendment

(13) Atmospheric and biogenic carbon that is captured and stored through *an* activity risks being released back into the atmosphere (e.g. reversal) due to natural *causes, including extreme weather and force majeure events*, or anthropogenic causes. Therefore, operators should take all relevant preventive measures to mitigate those risks and duly monitor that carbon continues to be stored over the monitoring period laid down for the relevant activity. The validity of the *certificate* should depend on the expected duration of the storage *or biogenic emission reduction* and the different risks of reversal associated with the given activity. Activities that store carbon in geological formations provide enough certainties on the very long-term duration of several centuries for the stored carbon and can be considered as providing permanent storage of carbon. *Therefore, the monitoring period and requirements of the certified storage generated by permanent carbon*

this risk, *the validity of the certified carbon removals generated by carbon farming and carbon storage in products should be subject to an expiry date matching with the end of the relevant monitoring period. Thereafter, the carbon should be assumed to be released into the atmosphere, unless the economic operator proves the maintenance of the carbon storage through uninterrupted monitoring activities.*

removals should be consistent with the provisions set out in Articles 13, 17 and 18 of Directive 2009/31/EC. Carbon farming or carbon storage in products are more exposed to the risk of voluntary or involuntary release of carbon into the atmosphere. To account for this risk, the monitoring period of the certified sequestration or emission reduction generated by carbon farming should cover at least the entire duration over which the results of the activity are projected to be sustained as set out in the applicable certification methodology, and the monitoring period of the certified sequestration generated by carbon storage in products should cover the entire lifetime of the product until and including the end of life of the product. However, in the case of carbon farming, in order to avoid undue administrative burdens on individual operators, the operator or group of operators may opt to designate a legal person or relevant authority, such as the paying agency within the meaning of Article 9 of Regulation (EU) 2021/2116 in the case of carbon farming activities registered in the LPIS, to be responsible for the monitoring, subject to all requirements under this Regulation being met.

Proposal for a regulation
Recital 14

Text proposed by the Commission

(14) In addition to measures taken to minimise the risk of carbon release into the atmosphere during the monitoring period, appropriate liability mechanisms should be introduced to address cases of reversal. Such mechanisms *could* include e.g. discounting of carbon removal units, collective buffers or accounts of carbon removal units, and up-front insurance mechanisms. *Since liability mechanisms in respect of geological storage and CO₂ leakage, and relevant corrective measures*

Amendment

(14) In addition to measures taken to minimise the risk of carbon release into the atmosphere during the monitoring period, appropriate liability mechanisms should be introduced *and a liable physical or legal person should be designated to be responsible* to address cases of reversal. *For permanent carbon removal activities, the liability mechanism should be consistent with the liability mechanism set out in Directive 2009/31/EC to avoid double regulation, while for carbon*

have already been laid down by Directive 2003/87/EC and Directive 2009/31/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council²⁷, those liability mechanisms and corrective measures should apply to avoid double regulation.

farming activities, the liability mechanism should be set out and approved as part of the applicable certification methodology and ensure that equivalent carbon sequestration is generated as compensation for the reversal. Such mechanisms *may* include e.g. discounting of carbon removal units, collective buffers or accounts of carbon removal units, *a percentage of credits to be put in a pool managed by the certification scheme in the case of carbon farming activities*, and up-front insurance mechanisms. *In order to ensure that liability mechanisms continue to be fit for purpose, certification schemes should continuously monitor and ensure the availability and readiness of the liability mechanisms throughout the monitoring period of an activity.*

²⁷ Directive 2009/31/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 23 April 2009 on the geological storage of carbon dioxide and amending Council Directive 85/337/EEC, European Parliament and Council Directives 2000/60/EC, 2001/80/EC, 2004/35/EC, 2006/12/EC, 2008/1/EC and Regulation (EC) No 1013/2006 (OJ L 140, 5.6.2009, p. 114).

²⁷ Directive 2009/31/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 23 April 2009 on the geological storage of carbon dioxide and amending Council Directive 85/337/EEC, European Parliament and Council Directives 2000/60/EC, 2001/80/EC, 2004/35/EC, 2006/12/EC, 2008/1/EC and Regulation (EC) No 1013/2006 (OJ L 140, 5.6.2009, p. 114).

Proposal for a regulation

Recital 14a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(14a) To account for this risk of reversal and ensure the climate integrity of the framework, the certified units should be suspended in the registry until the reversal has been addressed through the liability mechanism. Where a reversal has not been addressed through the liability mechanism within a reasonable timeframe, the validity of the certificate should expire and the corresponding units should be cancelled from the registry and the operator or group of operators should be subject to a corrective penalty

reflecting the carbon cost of the amount of carbon released to the atmosphere. For carbon farming activities and carbon storage in products, the validity of the certified units should be subject to an expiry date matching with the end of the relevant monitoring period. Thereafter, or in case the monitoring has been discontinued before the end of the monitoring period, the net benefit generated by the activity should be assumed to be released to the atmosphere and the corresponding units shall be cancelled in the registry, , unless the economic operator proves the maintenance of the carbon storage through uninterrupted monitoring activities.

<p>Compromise Amendment 10 Article 7, Recitals 15 and 17 (Sustainability) Compromise amendment replacing Amendments 57-60; 140; 343; 478; 539; 627-678; 722; 724-727; AGRI 66; AGRI 77-85; ITRE 41-43 and corresponding Amendments 19-20; 102; 106; 108; 140; 213-225; 234-241; AGRI 17; AGRI 19; ITRE 17; ITRE 19</p>

Proposal for a regulation
Article 7 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

1. A carbon removal activity shall **have a** neutral impact on or generate co-benefits for **all** the following sustainability objectives:
- (a) climate change mitigation beyond the net **carbon removal** benefit referred to in Article 4(1);
 - (b) climate change adaptation;
 - (c) sustainable use and protection of water and marine resources;
 - (d) transition to a circular economy;
 - (e) pollution prevention and control;

Amendment

1. A carbon removal activity shall **at least have a** neutral impact **on each or may** generate co-benefits **for one or more of the following sustainability objectives**:
- (a) climate change mitigation beyond the net benefit referred to in Article 4(1);
(ab) the avoidance of the risk of carbon leakage in third countries;
 - (b) climate change adaptation;
 - (c) sustainable use and protection of water and marine resources;
 - (d) transition to a circular economy, **including the efficient use of sustainably**

(f) protection and restoration of biodiversity and ecosystems;

sourced bio-based materials;

(e) pollution prevention and control;

(f) protection and restoration of biodiversity and ecosystems;

**Proposal for a regulation
Article 7 – paragraph 1a (new)**

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

1a. A carbon farming activity shall at least generate co-benefits on the sustainability objective referred to in paragraph 1a, point (f) [protection and restoration of biodiversity and ecosystems] and shall at least have a neutral impact on each of the other or may generate co-benefits for one or more of the other following sustainability objectives:

(a) climate change mitigation beyond the net carbon farming benefit referred to in Article [4(1a)];(b) climate change adaptation;

(c) sustainable use and protection or improvement of water quality and marine resources;

(d) transition to a circular economy, including the efficient use of sustainably sourced bio-based materials;

(e) pollution prevention and control;

(ea) prevention of soil degradation, soil restoration, improvement of soil fertility and of nutrient management and soil biota;

(f) protection and restoration of biodiversity and ecosystems;

**Proposal for a regulation
Article 7 – paragraph 1b (new)**

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

1b. A carbon storage in product activity shall at least have a neutral impact on each and shall generate co-

benefits for at least one of the following sustainability objectives:

(a) climate change mitigation beyond the net carbon farming benefit referred to in Article [4(1a)];(b) climate change adaptation;

(c) sustainable use and protection **or** improvement of water **quality** and marine resources;

(d) transition to a circular economy, including the efficient use of sustainably sourced bio-based materials;

(e) pollution prevention and control;

(ea) prevention of soil degradation, soil restoration, improvement of soil fertility and of nutrient management and soil biota;

(f) protection and restoration of biodiversity and ecosystems;

**Proposal for a regulation
Article 7 – paragraph 1 b (new)**

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

1c. Carbon farming activities shall not negatively affect the Union’s food security and shall not lead to land grabbing or land speculation. They shall respect the rights of local communities and indigenous people affected by those activities, both within and outside the Union, as well as the balance between the environmental, economic and social impact on local communities and small-scale land managers.

Any activities under the scope of this Regulation shall not negatively affect other activities under the scope of this Regulation.

Proposal for a regulation
Article 7 – paragraph 3

Text proposed by the Commission

3. Where an operator or group of operators report co-benefits that contribute to the sustainability objectives referred to in paragraph 1 beyond the minimum sustainability requirements referred to in paragraph 2, they shall comply with the certification methodologies set out in delegated acts referred to in Article 8. The certification methodologies shall incentivise ***as much as possible*** the generation of co-benefits going beyond the minimum sustainability requirements, in particular for the objective referred to in paragraph 1, point (f).

Amendment

3. Where an operator or group of operators report co-benefits that contribute to the sustainability objectives referred to in paragraph 1, ***1a or 1b*** beyond the minimum sustainability requirements referred to in paragraph 2, they shall comply with the certification methodologies set out in delegated acts referred to in Article 8. The certification methodologies shall incentivise the generation of co-benefits going beyond the minimum sustainability requirements for the objectives referred to in paragraph 1a ***and shall provide for the possibility to generate a carbon farming premium for such co-benefits, for which the Commission shall set out the methodology by delegated acts no later than one year after the entry into force of this legislation. Certificates shall indicate whether an activity has a neutral impact or generates co-benefits for the sustainability objectives.***

Proposal for a regulation
Article 7 – paragraph 2

Text proposed by the Commission

2. For the purposes of paragraph 1, ***a carbon removal activity*** shall ***comply with*** minimum sustainability requirements ***laid down in the certification methodologies, set out in*** the delegated acts adopted pursuant to Article 8.

Amendment

2. For the purposes of paragraph 1, ***1a, 1b and 1c, the Commission*** shall ***set out the*** minimum sustainability requirements ***for each type of activity in the relevant certification methodology, as part of*** the delegated acts adopted pursuant to Article 8. ***The minimum sustainability requirements shall take into account the impacts both within and outside the Union and local conditions. Those minimum sustainability requirements shall, as appropriate, be consistent with the technical screening criteria for the ‘do no significant harm’ principle concerning forestry activities and underground permanent geological storage of CO₂, laid***

down in Delegated Regulation (EU) 2021/2139, and shall promote the sustainability of forest and agriculture biomass raw material in accordance with the sustainability and GHG saving criteria for biomass laid down in Article 29 of Directive (EU) 2018/2001.

Proposal for a regulation Recital 15

Text proposed by the Commission

(15) Carbon removal activities have a strong potential to deliver win-win solutions for sustainability, even if trade-offs cannot be excluded. Therefore, it is appropriate to establish minimum sustainability requirements to ensure that carbon removal activities have a neutral impact or generate co-benefits for the sustainability objectives of climate change mitigation and adaptation, the protection and restoration of biodiversity and ecosystems, the sustainable use and protection of water and marine resources, the transition to a circular economy, and pollution prevention and control. Those sustainability requirements should, as appropriate, **and taking into consideration** local conditions, **build on** the technical screening criteria for **Do Not Significant Harm** concerning forestry activities and underground permanent geological storage of CO₂, laid down in Commission Delegated Regulation (EU) 2021/2139²⁸, and on the sustainability criteria for forest and agriculture biomass raw material laid down in Article 29 of Directive (EU) 2018/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council²⁹. Practices, such as forest monocultures, that produce harmful effects for biodiversity should not be eligible for certification.

Amendment

(15) Carbon removal, **carbon farming and carbon storage in product** activities have a strong potential to deliver win-win solutions for sustainability, even if trade-offs cannot be excluded. Therefore, it is appropriate to establish minimum sustainability requirements to ensure that carbon removal activities have **at least** a neutral impact or generate co-benefits for the sustainability objectives of climate change mitigation and adaptation, the protection and restoration of biodiversity and ecosystems, the sustainable use and protection of water and marine resources, the transition to a circular economy, and pollution prevention and control, **to ensure that carbon farming activities generate co-benefits for at least the protection and restoration of biodiversity and ecosystems and have at least a neutral impact on the sustainability objectives of climate change mitigation and adaptation, the sustainable use and protection or improvement of water quality and marine resources, the transition to a circular economy, pollution prevention and control and prevention of soil degradation, soil restoration, improvement of soil fertility and of nutrient management and soil biota, and to ensure that carbon storage in products activities generate co-benefits for at least one and have at least a neutral impact on the rest of the sustainability objectives of climate change mitigation and adaptation, the protection and restoration of biodiversity and ecosystems, the sustainable use and protection or**

improvement of water quality and marine resources, the transition to a circular economy, pollution prevention and control and prevention of soil degradation, soil restoration, improvement of soil fertility and of nutrient management and soil biota.

Those sustainability requirements should, as appropriate, *take into account the impacts both within and outside the Union as well as local conditions, and be consistent with* the technical screening criteria *for the ‘do no significant harm’ principle* concerning forestry activities and underground permanent geological storage of CO₂, laid down in Commission Delegated Regulation (EU) 2021/2139²⁸, and *should promote* the sustainability criteria for forest and agriculture biomass raw material *in accordance with the sustainability and GHG saving criteria for biomass* laid down in Article 29 of Directive (EU) 2018/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council²⁹. Practices, such as forest monocultures, that produce harmful effects for biodiversity should not be eligible for certification.

²⁸ Commission Delegated Regulation (EU) 2021/2139 of 4 June 2021 supplementing Regulation (EU) 2020/852 of the European Parliament and of the Council by establishing the technical screening criteria for determining the conditions under which an economic activity qualifies as contributing substantially to climate change mitigation or climate change adaptation and for determining whether that economic activity causes no significant harm to any of the other environmental objectives (OJ L 442, 9.12.2021, p. 1).

²⁹ Directive (EU) 2018/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 11 December 2018 on the promotion of the use of energy from renewable sources (OJ L 328, 21.12.2018, p. 82).

²⁸ Commission Delegated Regulation (EU) 2021/2139 of 4 June 2021 supplementing Regulation (EU) 2020/852 of the European Parliament and of the Council by establishing the technical screening criteria for determining the conditions under which an economic activity qualifies as contributing substantially to climate change mitigation or climate change adaptation and for determining whether that economic activity causes no significant harm to any of the other environmental objectives (OJ L 442, 9.12.2021, p. 1).

²⁹ Directive (EU) 2018/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 11 December 2018 on the promotion of the use of energy from renewable sources (OJ L 328, 21.12.2018, p. 82).

Or. en

Proposal for a regulation
Recital 15a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

15a Furthermore, carbon farming activities should not negatively affect the Union's food security and should not lead to land grabbing or land speculation. They should respect the rights of local communities and indigenous people affected by those activities, both within and outside the Union, as well as the balance between the environmental, economic and social impact on local communities and small-scale land managers.

Proposal for a regulation
Recital 17

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(17) Operators or groups of operators may report co-benefits that contribute to the sustainability objectives beyond the minimum sustainability requirements. To this end, their reporting should comply with the certification methodologies tailored to the different ***carbon removal*** activities, developed by the Commission. Certification methodologies should, as much as possible, incentivise the generation of co-benefits for biodiversity going beyond the minimum sustainability requirements. These additional co-benefits will give more economic value to the certified carbon removals and will result in higher revenues for the operators. In the light of these considerations, ***it is appropriate for the Commission to prioritise the development of tailored certification methodologies on carbon farming activities that provide significant co-benefits for biodiversity.***

(17) Operators or groups of operators may report co-benefits that contribute to the sustainability objectives beyond the minimum sustainability requirements ***and certificates should clearly indicate the positive co-benefits generated by an activity, where applicable.*** To this end, their reporting should comply with the certification methodologies tailored to the different activities, developed by the Commission. Certification methodologies should, as much as possible, incentivise the generation of co-benefits for biodiversity going beyond the minimum sustainability requirements ***and, in the case of carbon farming activities, provide for the possibility to generate a carbon farming premium for such co-benefits.*** These additional co-benefits will give more economic value to the certified ***activities*** and will result in higher revenues for the operators. In the light of these considerations, the Commission ***should*** prioritise the development of tailored certification methodologies on ***those types***

of activities that are the most mature, have the potential for generating the largest net benefits and that have the potential to provide the largest co-benefits. In the case of carbon farming activities, the prioritisation should in addition take into account whether the activities contribute to sustainable management of agricultural land and forests.

Compromise Amendment 11 Articles 8, 8a (new) and 15, Recitals 7 and 16 (Certification methodologies, Platform)

Compromise amendment replacing Amendments 61-65; 479; 522; 524; 679-716; 727, 853-854, 717-721; 847-848; 854; 923; AGRI 62; AGRI 86-94; AGRI 114 ITRE 44-47 and corresponding Amendments 226-233; 243-249; AGRI 18; AGRI 20; ITRE 18; ITRE 21; ITRE 23 to Recitals

**Proposal for a regulation
Article 8 – paragraph 1**

Text proposed by the Commission

1. An operator or a group of operators shall apply the relevant certification methodologies to comply with the criteria laid down in Articles 4 to 7.

Amendment

1. An operator or a group of operators shall apply the relevant certification methodologies to comply with the criteria laid down in Articles 4 to 7.

**Proposal for a regulation
Article 8 – paragraph 2**

Text proposed by the Commission

2. The Commission *is empowered to* adopt delegated acts in accordance with Article 16 to establish the technical certification methodologies referred to in paragraph 1 for activities related to *permanent carbon storage, carbon farming and carbon storage in products*. Those certification methodologies shall include at least the elements set out in Annex I.

Amendment

2. The Commission *shall* adopt delegated acts in accordance with Article 16 to establish the technical certification methodologies referred to in paragraph 1 for activities related to *each type of activity*. *Each certification methodology for each type of activity shall be subject to a separate delegated act*. Those certification methodologies shall include at least the elements set out in Annex I. *The*

first such delegated act shall be adopted no later than 12 months after the entry into force of this regulation.

The Commission shall prioritise the development of certification methodologies for those types of activities that are the most mature, have the potential for generating the largest net benefits and that have the potential to provide the largest co-benefits. In the case of carbon farming activities, the Commission shall as a part of its prioritisation take into account in addition whether the activities contribute to sustainable management of agricultural land and forests. The delegated acts shall be reviewed periodically to include new or innovative activities, prepared in accordance with criteria listed in paragraphs 2a and 3

2a. Prior to adopting the delegated act referred to in paragraph 2 of this Article, the Commission shall consult the Platform referred to in Article 8a regarding the technical certification methodologies referred to in paragraph 2 of this Article.

2b. For each draft delegated act, the Commission shall carry out a thorough impact assessment, which shall be based on conclusive scientific evidence and a public consultation for a period of at least 4 weeks, and its final results shall be made public at the time of adoption of the related delegated act.

Within 6 months after the entry into force of this Regulation, the Commission shall, in accordance with paragraph 2 and after consulting the Platform, publish guidance for potential carbon farming operators or groups of operators on the list of carbon farming activities that will be prioritised in the preparation of the methodologies. This list may be periodically reviewed and extended.

Or. en

Proposal for a regulation
Article 8 – paragraph 3

Text proposed by the Commission

- (3) When preparing those delegated acts, the Commission shall take into account the following elements:
- (a) the objectives of ensuring the robustness of **carbon removals** and recognising the protection and restoration of ecosystems;
 - (b) the objective of minimising administrative burden for operators, particularly for small-scale **carbon farming** operators;
 - (c) relevant Union and national law;
 - (d) relevant Union and international certification methodologies and standards.

Amendment

- (3) When preparing those delegated acts, the Commission shall take into account the following elements:
- (a) the objectives of ensuring the robustness of **the activities** and recognising the protection and restoration of ecosystems;
 - (aa) the certification methodologies shall be based on the best available scientific evidence and the precautionary principle enshrined in Article 191 TFEU;**
 - (ab) the outcome of the public consultation and the advice of the Platform;**
 - (ac) existing standards and best practices in the certification methodologies, where they comply with the requirements and criteria set out in this Regulation;**
 - (b) the objective of minimising administrative **and financial** burden **and keeping the certification procedure as simple as possible** for operators, particularly for small-scale carbon farming operators **and for small and medium enterprises, without compromising the quality of the carbon removals or co-benefits;**
 - (ba) the certification methodologies shall be easy to use and set in a manner that facilitates the verification of their compliance;**
 - (c) relevant Union and national law;
 - (d) relevant Union and international certification methodologies and standards.

Proposal for a regulation
Article 8 – paragraph 3 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

3a. The Commission shall make the certification methodologies publicly available.

Proposal for a regulation
Article 8a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Platform on Carbon Removal, Carbon Farming and Carbon Storage in Product Activities

1. The Commission shall establish a Platform on Carbon removal and Carbon farming Activities (the ‘Platform’). It shall be composed in a balanced manner of the following groups:

(a) representatives of:

(i) the European Environment Agency;

(ii) the European Scientific Advisory Board on Climate Change established under Article 10a of Regulation (EC) No 401/2009 of the European Parliament and of the Council;

(b) experts representing relevant private stakeholders, including farmers and forest owners or managers, and business sectors, representing relevant industries, involved in the areas covered by this Regulation;

(ba) representatives of certification schemes;

(c) experts representing civil society with expertise in the areas covered by this Regulation;

(d) experts appointed in a personal capacity, who have proven knowledge and experience in the areas covered by this Regulation;

(e) experts representing academia, including universities, research institutes

and other scientific organisations.

The members of the Expert Group on Carbon Removals shall be integrated into the representatives and experts referred to in points (a) to (e) in a way that guarantees that groups in points (a) to (e) are represented in a balanced manner.

2. The Platform shall:

(a) advise the Commission on the technical certification methodologies referred to in Article 8, including on the minimum sustainability requirements referred to in Article 7, as well as on the possible need to update those certification methodologies;

(b) analyse the impact of the technical certification methodologies in terms of potential costs and benefits of their application;

(c) assist the Commission in analysing requests from stakeholders to develop or revise technical certification methodologies for a given activity;

(d) monitor and regularly report to the Commission on trends at Union and Member State level regarding carbon removal and carbon farming;

(e) advise the Commission on the possible need to develop further measures to improve data availability and quality.

(f) advise the Commission on the usability of the technical certification methodologies, taking into account the need to avoid undue administrative burdens;

(g) advise the Commission on the possible need to amend this Regulation;

(h) advise the Commission on the minimum information included in the certificates referred to in Article 9, as well as on the rules and procedures related to audits and certification schemes, as well as on the possible need to update those;

3. The Platform shall take into account the views of a wide range of stakeholders. The selection of the members shall seek to ensure a varied disciplinary and sectoral expertise, as well as gender and geographical balance.

4. The Platform shall be chaired by a member of the Platform elected by the Platform and constituted in accordance with the horizontal rules on the creation and operation of Commission expert groups. In that context the Commission may invite experts with specific expertise on an ad hoc basis.

5. The Platform shall carry out its tasks in accordance with the principle of transparency. The Commission shall publish the minutes of the meetings of the Platform and other relevant documents on the Commission website.

6. Where operators or groups of operators consider that an activity which does not comply with the technical certification methodologies established pursuant to this Regulation, or for which such technical certification methodologies have not yet been established, should be eligible for certification under this Regulation, they may inform the Platform thereof.

Proposal for a regulation

Article 15 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

The Commission is empowered to adopt delegated acts in accordance with Article 16 to amend Annex II in order to adapt the list of minimum information included in the certificates referred to in Article 9.

Amendment

The Commission, ***after consulting the Platform referred to in Article 8a***, is empowered to adopt delegated acts in accordance with Article 16 to amend Annex II in order to adapt the list of minimum information included in the certificates referred to in Article 9.

Proposal for a regulation
Recital 18

Text proposed by the Commission

(18) It is appropriate to develop detailed certification methodologies for the different **carbon removal** activities in order to apply, in a standardised, verifiable and comparable way, the quality criteria laid down in this Regulation. Those methodologies should ensure the robust and transparent certification of the net **carbon removal** benefit generated by the **carbon removal** activity, **while avoiding** disproportionate administrative burden for operators or group of operators, in particular for small farmers and forest holders. To this end, the Commission should be empowered to supplement this Regulation by adopting delegated acts establishing detailed certification methodologies for the different **carbon removal** activities. Those methodologies should be developed in close consultation with the **Expert Group** on Carbon Removals and all other interested actors. They need to be based on the best available scientific evidence, build upon existing public and private schemes and methodologies for **carbon removal** certification, and take into account any relevant standard and rules adopted at national **and** Union level.

Proposal for a regulation
Recital 16

Text proposed by the Commission

(16) Farming practices that remove CO₂

PE749.285v01-00

Amendment

(18) It is appropriate to develop detailed certification methodologies for the different activities in order to apply, in a standardised, verifiable and comparable way, the quality criteria laid down in this Regulation. Those methodologies should ensure the robust and transparent certification of the net benefit generated by the activity, **be easy to use and set in a manner that facilitates the verification of their compliance, and avoid** disproportionate administrative **and financial** burden for operators or group of operators, in particular for small farmers and forest holders **and for small and medium enterprises, without compromising the quality of the carbon removals or co-benefits**. To this end, the Commission should be empowered to supplement this Regulation by adopting delegated acts establishing detailed certification methodologies for the different **carbon removal** activities. Those methodologies should be developed in close consultation with the **Platform** on Carbon Removals , **Carbon Farming and Carbon Storage in Product Activities** and all other interested actors. They need to be based on **a thorough impact assessment based on the best available scientific evidence and a minimum a 4-week public consultation period, and** build upon existing public and private schemes and methodologies for certification **where these comply with the requirements and criteria set out in this Regulation**, and take into account any relevant standard and rules adopted at national, Union **and international** level.

Amendment

(16) Farming practices that remove CO₂

AM\1280180EN.docx

from the atmosphere contribute to the climate neutrality objective and should be rewarded, either via the Common Agricultural Policy (CAP) or other public or private initiatives. ***Specifically, this Regulation should take into account farming practices as referenced in the Communication on Sustainable Carbon Cycles³⁰.***

from the atmosphere contribute to the climate neutrality objective and should be rewarded, either via the Common Agricultural Policy (CAP) or other public or private initiatives. ***The Commission should, after consulting the Platform and within 6 months after the entry into force of this Regulation, publish guidance to inform potential carbon farming operators or groups of operators about those carbon farming activities that will be prioritised in the preparation of the certification methodologies.***

³⁰ ***Communication from the Commission, Sustainable Carbon Cycles, COM (2022) 800.***

Compromise Amendment 20 Annex I and II, Recital 28
 Compromise amendment replacing Amendments 77-80; 876-890; 892-893; 894-922; 925 AGRI 109-113; AGRI 115-120 and corresponding Amendments 270, 299-302, AGRI 27 on Recitals

**Proposal for a regulation
Annex I**

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Elements of the certification methodologies referred to in Article 8

Elements of the certification methodologies referred to in Article 8

When adopting delegated acts pursuant to Article 8, the certification methodologies shall include at least the following elements:

When adopting delegated acts pursuant to Article 8, the certification methodologies shall include at least the following elements:

(a) description of the ***carbon removal*** activity covered, including its monitoring period;

(-a) description of the type of activity covered (carbon removal, carbon farming sequestration, carbon farming carbon, nitrogen or methane emission reduction, or carbon storage in products)

(a) ***detailed*** description of the activity covered, including ***the projected durability of its results and*** its monitoring period;

(b) rules for identifying all carbon removal sinks and GHG emission sources referred to in Article 4(1);

(c) rules for calculating the carbon removals under the baseline referred to in Article 4(1), point (a);

(d) rules for calculating the total carbon removals referred to in Article 4(1), point (b);

(e) rules for calculating the increase in direct and indirect greenhouse gas emissions referred to in Article 4(1), point (c);

(b) for carbon removal activities:

(i) rules for identifying all carbon removal sinks and GHG emission sources referred to in Article 4(1);

(ii) rules for calculating the carbon removals under the baseline referred to in Article 4(1), point (a);

(iii) rules for calculating the total carbon removals referred to in Article 4(1), point (b);

(iv) rules for calculating the increase in direct and indirect greenhouse gas emissions referred to in Article 4(1), point (c);

(c) for carbon farming activities:

(i) rules for identifying all carbon sequestration sinks and reductions and GHG emission reductions and sources referred to in Article 4(2);

(ii) for carbon farming sequestration, rules for calculating the carbon sequestration under the baseline referred to in Article 4(2)(1), point (a);

(iii) for carbon farming sequestration, rules for calculating the total carbon sequestration referred to in Article 4(2)(1), point (b);

(iv) for carbon farming sequestration, rules for calculating the increase in direct and indirect greenhouse gas emissions referred to in Article 4(2)(1), point (c);

(v) for carbon farming emission reductions, rules for calculating the carbon emissions under the baseline referred to in Article 4(2)(2), point (a);

(vi) for carbon farming reductions, rules for calculating the total carbon reduction referred to in Article 4(2)(2), point (b);

(vii) for carbon farming emission

reductions, rules for calculating the increase in direct and indirect greenhouse gas emissions referred to in Article 4(2)(2), point (c);

(viii) for carbon farming emission reductions, rules for calculating the N₂O emissions under the baseline referred to in Article 4(2)(2), point (d);

(ix) for carbon farming emission reductions, rules for calculating the total N₂O emission reductions referred to in Article 4(2)(2), point (e);

(x) for carbon farming emission reductions, rules for calculating the CH₄ emissions under the baseline referred to in Article 4(2)(2), point (f);

(xi) for carbon farming emission reductions, rules for calculating the total CH₄ emissions referred to in Article 4(2)(2), point (g);

(d) for carbon storage in product activities:

(i) rules for identifying all carbon sequestration sinks and GHG emission sources referred to in Article 4(2a);

(ii) rules for calculating the carbon sequestration under the baseline referred to in Article 4(2a), point (a);

(iii) rules for calculating the total carbon sequestration referred to in Article 4(2a), point (b);

(iv) rules for calculating the increase in direct and indirect greenhouse gas emissions referred to in Article 4(2a), point (c);

(f) rules to address uncertainties in the quantification of carbon removals referred to in Article 4(8);

(e) rules to address uncertainties in the quantification of carbon removals referred to in Article 4(4);

(f) *the baseline referred to in Article*

- (g) rules to carry out the specific additionality tests referred to in Article 5(2);
- (h) rules on monitoring and mitigation of any risk of release of the stored carbon referred to in Article 6(2), *point (a)*;
- (i) rules on appropriate liability mechanisms referred to in Article 6(2), *point (b)*;
- (j) rules on the minimum sustainability requirements referred to in Article 7(2);
- (k) rules on the monitoring and reporting of co-benefits referred to in Article 7(3).

Proposal for a regulation Annex II

Text proposed by the Commission

Minimum information included in the certificate referred to in Article 9

- (a) name and type of the ***carbon removal*** activity, including the name and contact details of the operator or group of operators;
- (b) the location of the ***carbon removal*** activity, including geographically explicit location of the activity boundaries, respecting 1:5000 mapping scale requirements for the Member State;

4(5), 4(5a) or 4(6), including the rules and justification for the established baseline;

- (g) rules to carry out the specific additionality tests referred to in Article 5(2);
- (h) rules on monitoring and mitigation of any risk of release of the stored carbon referred to in Article 6(2a);
- (i) rules on appropriate liability mechanisms referred to in Article 6(2b);
- (ia) rules on the validity and penalties referred to in Article 6(2c) and 6(2c);***
- (j) ***specification of*** the minimum sustainability requirements referred to in Article 7(2);
- (k) rules on the monitoring and reporting of co-benefits referred to in Article 7(3).

Amendment

Minimum information included in the certificate referred to in Article 9

- (a) name and type of the activity, ***including whether the activity constitutes a carbon removal, carbon farming sequestration, carbon farming carbon, nitrogen or methane emission reduction, or carbon storage in products activity***, including the name and contact details of the operator or group of operators;
- (b) the location of the activity, including geographically explicit location of the activity boundaries, respecting 1:5000 mapping scale requirements for the Member State;
- (ba) for carbon farming activities, where applicable, a unique identification of the agricultural parcel as registered in the identification system for agricultural parcels provided for in Article 68 of Regulation (EU) No 2116/2021 on which***

- (c) start date and end date of the **carbon removal** activity;
- (d) name of the certification scheme;
- (e) name and address of the certification body and logo;
- (f) (unique) certificate number or code;
- (g) place and date of issuance of the certificate;
- (h) reference to the applicable certification methodology referred to in Article 8;
- (i) net carbon removal benefit referred to in Article 4(1);

(j) carbon removals under the baseline referred to in Article 4(1), point (a);

(k) total carbon removals referred to in Article 4(1), point (b);

(l) increase in direct and indirect greenhouse gas emissions referred to in Article 4(1), point (c);

carbon farming activity is taking place;

(c) start date and ***expected*** end date of the activity;

(d) name of the certification scheme;

(e) name and address of the certification body and logo;

(f) (unique) certificate number or code;

(g) place and date of issuance of the certificate;

(h) reference to the applicable certification methodology referred to in Article 8;

(i) for carbon removal activities:

(i) net carbon removal benefit referred to in Article 4(1);

(ii) carbon removals under the baseline referred to in Article 4(1), point (a);

(iii) total carbon removals referred to in Article 4(1), point (b);

(iv) increase in direct and indirect greenhouse gas emissions referred to in Article 4(1), point (c);

(ia) for carbon farming activities:

(i) for carbon farming sequestration, net carbon farming sequestration benefit referred to in Article 4(2);

(ii) for carbon farming sequestration, carbon sequestration under the baseline referred to in Article 4(2)(1), point (a);

(iii) for carbon farming sequestration, total carbon sequestration referred to in Article 4(2)(1), point (b);

(iv) for carbon farming sequestration, increase in direct and indirect greenhouse gas emissions referred to in Article 4(2)(1), point (c);

(v) for carbon farming emission

reductions, net carbon farming emission reduction benefit referred to in Article 4(2)(2);

(vi) for carbon farming emission reductions, carbon emissions under the baseline referred to in Article 4(2)(2), point (a);

(vii) for carbon farming emission reductions, total carbon reduction referred to in Article 4(2)(2), point (b);

(viii) for carbon farming emission reductions, increase in direct and indirect greenhouse gas emissions referred to in Article 4(2)(2), point (c);

(ix) for carbon farming emission reductions, N₂O emissions under the baseline referred to in Article 4(2)(2), point (d);

(x) for carbon farming emission reductions, total N₂O emission reductions referred to in Article 4(2)(2), point (e);

(xi) for carbon farming emission reductions, CH₄ emissions under the baseline referred to in Article 4(2)(2), point (f);

(xii) for carbon farming emission reductions, total CH₄ emissions referred to in Article 4(2)(2), point (g);

(ib) for carbon storage in product activities:

(i) net carbon product sequestration benefit referred to in Article 4(2a);

(ii) carbon sequestration under the baseline referred to in Article 4(2a), point (a);

(iii) total carbon sequestration referred to in Article 4(2a), point (b);

(iv) increase in direct and indirect

greenhouse gas emissions referred to in Article 4(2a), point (c);

(m) breakdown by gases, sources, carbon sinks and stocks with regard to the information referred to in points (j), (k) and (l) of this Annex;

(n) duration of the monitoring period of the ***carbon removal*** activity;

(o) ***any*** sustainability ***co-benefits*** referred to in Article 7(3);

(p) reference to any other carbon removal certification.

(m) breakdown by gases, sources, carbon sinks and stocks with regard to the information referred to in points (i), (ia) and (ib) of this Annex;

(n) ***storage medium, expected*** duration of the ***results and duration of*** the monitoring period of the activity ***in accordance with Article 6(2a);***

(na), detailed liability mechanism and liable legal or physical person in accordance with Article 6(2b);

(nb) in case of reversal, the amount of total carbon released in the atmosphere from geological or biogenic carbon pools;

(o) ***for a carbon removal activity, evidence that the activity meets the sustainability objectives referred to in Article 7(1) or that the activity generates co-benefits;***

(oa) for a carbon farming activity, evidence that the activity meets the sustainability objectives referred to in Article 7(1a) and that the activity also generates positive co-benefits in relation to the objective in point (f);

(ob) for a carbon storage in product activity, evidence that the activity meets the sustainability objectives referred to in Article 7(1b) and that the activity also generates positive co-benefits in relation to at least one of those objectives;

(ob) quantity of units certified by the certificate in accordance with Article 9;

(p) reference to any other carbon removal ***or carbon farming or carbon storage in product*** certification.



2022/0394(COD)

11.10.2023

COMPROMISE AMENDMENTS 12 - 19 (version 2)

BLOCK 4 (Articles 9-17, Annex IIa)

Draft report
Lídia Pereira
(PE745.292v02-00)

Establishing a Union certification framework for carbon removals

Proposal for a regulation
(COM(2022)0672 – C9-0399/2022 – 2022/0394(COD))

Compromise Amendment

12

Article 9, Recitals 19-20 (Certification of compliance)

Compromise amendment replacing Amendments 67-69, 464; 730-765, AGRI 95-99 and corresponding amendments on recitals 250-258, AGRI 21-22, ITRE 22

Proposal for a regulation
Article 9 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

1. To apply for a certification of compliance with this Regulation, an operator or a group of operators shall submit an application to a certification scheme. Upon acceptance of that application, the operator or a group of operators shall submit to a certification body a comprehensive description of the **carbon removal** activity, including the certification methodology applied to assess compliance with Articles 4 to 7, the expected total **carbon removals and net carbon removal** benefit. Groups of operators shall also specify how advisory services on **carbon removal** activities are provided, in particular to small-scale carbon farming operators.

Amendment

1. To apply for a certification of compliance with this Regulation, an operator or a group of operators shall submit an application to a certification scheme. Upon acceptance of that application, the operator or a group of operators shall submit to a certification body a comprehensive description of the activity, including the certification methodology applied to assess compliance with Articles 3a to 7, and the expected total net benefit. Groups of operators shall also specify how advisory services on activities are provided **and what measures are taken to limit administrative burden for land managers**, in particular to small-scale operators. **For operators or groups of operators involved in cross-border and/or multi-country projects it is possible to appoint a single certification body for all cross-border and multi-country projects.**

For carbon farming activities, Member States may provide advice to farmers in the framework of the advisory services referred to in Article 15 or Regulation (EU) 2021/2115.

For carbon farming, agricultural parcels registered in the Land Parcel Identification System (LPIS) set out in article 68 of Regulation (EU) 2116/2021 on which a carbon farming activity certified by a certification scheme is taking place cannot be certified for the same activity by a different certification scheme.

In order to ensure consistency with Annex

I(ba), for carbon farming, the following information shall be registered in the Identification system for agricultural parcels, provided for in Article 68 of Regulation (EU) 2016/2021, where applicable: management practices related to the carbon farming activity, start date and end date of the carbon removal activity, name of the certification scheme and unique certificate number or code on a particular agricultural parcel.

Or. en

Proposal for a regulation Article 9 – paragraph 2

Text proposed by the Commission

2. The certification body shall conduct a certification audit to verify the information submitted in accordance with paragraph 1 and to confirm compliance of the **carbon removal** activity with Articles 4 to 7. As a result of that certification audit, the certification body shall issue a certification audit report, that includes a summary, and a certificate containing, as a minimum, the information set out in Annex II. The certification scheme shall control the certification audit report and the certificate, and make the **summary of the** certification audit report and the certificate publicly available in **a** registry referred to in Article 12.

Amendment

2. The **certification scheme shall appoint a** certification body, which shall conduct a certification audit to verify **that** the information submitted in accordance with paragraph 1 **is accurate and reliable, and** confirm compliance of the activity with Articles **3a** to 7. **When multiple different carbon farming activities take place on farm level, the certification audits may be conducted at a single occasion. When** as a result of that certification audit **the compliance of the information submitted in accordance with paragraph 1 has been verified,** the certification body shall issue a certification audit report, that includes a summary, and a certificate containing, as a minimum, the information set out in Annex II. The certification scheme shall control the certification audit report and the certificate, and make the certification audit report and the certificate publicly available in **full or, where necessary to preserve the confidentiality of commercially sensitive information in conformity with the relevant Union and national law, excluding this commercially sensitive information, in the Union** registry referred to in Article 12.

Proposal for a regulation
Article 9 – paragraph 3

Text proposed by the Commission

3. The certification body shall carry out periodic re-certification audits to reconfirm compliance of the **carbon removal** activity with Articles 4 to 7 and verify the generated **carbon** benefit. As a result of that re-certification audit, the certification body shall issue a re-certification audit report, that includes a summary, and an updated certificate. The certification scheme shall control the re-certification audit report and the updated certificate, and make the **summary of the** re-certification audit report, the updated certificate and the certified carbon removal units publicly available in **a** registry referred to in Article 12.

Amendment

3. The certification body shall carry out periodic re-certification audits to reconfirm compliance of the activity with Articles **3a** to 7 and verify the generated **net** benefit. **Re-certification audits shall take place at least every 5 years for carbon farming activities, and at least every 10 years for other activities, following a risk-based approach.** As a result of that re-certification audit, the certification body shall issue a re-certification audit report, that includes a summary, and an updated certificate. The certification scheme shall control the re-certification audit report and the updated certificate, and make the re-certification audit report, the updated certificate and the certified carbon removal units publicly available in **full or, where necessary to preserve the confidentiality of commercially sensitive information in conformity with the relevant Union and national law, excluding this commercially sensitive information, in the Union** registry referred to in Article 12.

Or. en

Proposal for a regulation
Article 9 – paragraph 4

Text proposed by the Commission

4. The operator or a group of operators shall support the certification body during certification and re-certification audits, notably by giving access to the activity premises and providing **relevant** data and documentation.

Amendment

4. The operator or a group of operators shall support the certification body during certification and re-certification audits, notably by giving access to the activity premises and providing **any** data and documentation **required.**

Proposal for a regulation
Article 9 – paragraph 4 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

4a. Certification bodies shall be remunerated by the certification scheme in order to ensure the independence of the (re)-certification audits.

Proposal for a regulation
Article 9 – paragraph 5

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

5. The Commission *may* adopt implementing acts to set out the structure, format, technical details of the comprehensive description of the **carbon removal** activity referred to in paragraph 1, and of the certification and re-certification audit reports referred to in paragraphs 2 and 3. Those implementing acts shall be adopted in accordance with the examination procedure referred to in Article 17.

5. The Commission **shall no later than 12 months after the entry into force of this Regulation** adopt implementing acts to set out the structure, format, technical details of the comprehensive description of the activity referred to in paragraph 1, and of the certification and re-certification audit reports referred to in paragraphs 2 and 3. Those implementing acts shall be adopted in accordance with the examination procedure referred to in Article 17.

Proposal for a regulation
Recital 19

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(19) In order to ensure a credible and reliable certification process, **carbon removal** activities should be subject to independent third-party auditing. In particular, **carbon removal** activities should be subject to an initial certification audit before their implementation, verifying their compliance with the quality criteria set out in this Regulation, including the correct quantification of the expected net carbon removal benefit. **Carbon removal** activities should also be subject to periodic re-certification audits to verify the

(19) In order to ensure a credible and reliable certification process, activities should be subject to independent third-party auditing. In particular, **all** activities should be subject to an initial certification audit before their implementation, verifying their compliance with the quality criteria set out in this Regulation, including the correct quantification of the expected net benefit. **All** activities should also be subject to periodic re-certification audits **at least every 5 years for carbon farming activities, and at least every 10 years for**

compliance of the generated carbon removals. To this end, the Commission should be empowered to adopt implementing acts to set out the structure, technical details, and the minimum information to be contained in the description of the **carbon removal** activity, and in the certification and re-certification audit reports.

other activities, following a risk-based approach, to verify the compliance of the generated carbon removals, carbon farming sequestration, carbon farming emission reductions or carbon storage in products. To this end, the Commission should be empowered to adopt implementing acts to set out the structure, technical details, and the minimum information to be contained in the description of the activity, and in the certification and re-certification audit reports.

Proposal for a regulation

Recital 20

Text proposed by the Commission

(20) Providing land managers with improved knowledge, tools and methods for a better assessment and optimisation of **the carbon removals** is key for cost-efficient implementation of mitigation actions and for securing their engagement in carbon farming. This is particularly relevant for Union small farmers or forest holders that often lack the know-how and the expertise required to implement carbon **removal** activities and to comply with the required quality criteria and related certification methodologies. Therefore, it is appropriate to require that producer organisations facilitate the provision of relevant advisory services through technical advice to their members. The Common Agricultural Policy and national State aid can support financially the provision of advisory services, knowledge exchange, training, information actions or interactive innovation projects with farmers and foresters.

Amendment

(20) Providing land managers with improved knowledge, tools and methods for a better assessment and optimisation of carbon **farming** is key for cost-efficient implementation of mitigation actions and for securing their engagement in carbon farming. This is particularly relevant for Union small farmers or forest holders that often lack the know-how and the expertise required to implement carbon **farming** activities and to comply with the required quality criteria and related certification methodologies. Therefore, it is appropriate to require that producer organisations facilitate the provision of relevant advisory services through technical advice to their members **and, where relevant, support them with guidance and resources**. The Common Agricultural Policy and national State aid, **as well as other financial instruments**, can support financially the provision of advisory services, knowledge exchange, training, information actions or interactive innovation projects with farmers and foresters. **In cases of tenancy, the scheme should ensure appropriate financial benefits or rewards for the manager of the land doing the work.**

Compromise Amendment 13 Article 10, Recital 22 (Certification bodies)
Compromise amendment replacing Amendments 70-71; 768-782, AGRI 100 and corresponding amendments on recitals 271-277, AGRI 24

Proposal for a regulation
Article 10 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

1. Certification bodies appointed by certification schemes shall be accredited by a national accreditation authority pursuant to Regulation (EC) No 765/2008 of the European Parliament and of the Council³⁷.

³⁷ Regulation (EC) No 765/2008 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 9 July 2008 setting out the requirements for accreditation and market surveillance relating to the marketing of products and repealing Regulation (EEC) No 339/93 (OJ L 218, 13.8.2008, p. 30).

Amendment

1. Certification bodies appointed by certification schemes shall be accredited by a national accreditation authority pursuant to Regulation (EC) No 765/2008 of the European Parliament and of the Council³⁷.
The list of accredited certification bodies shall be made publicly available in the Union registry referred to in Article 12.

³⁷ Regulation (EC) No 765/2008 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 9 July 2008 setting out the requirements for accreditation and market surveillance relating to the marketing of products and repealing Regulation (EEC) No 339/93 (OJ L 218, 13.8.2008, p. 30).

Or. en

Proposal for a regulation
Article 10 – paragraph 2

Text proposed by the Commission

2. Certification bodies shall be:

- (a) competent to carry out the certification and re-certification audits referred to in Article 9;
- (b) independent from the operators or from a group of operators, and carry out the activities required under this Regulation in the public interest.

Amendment

2. Certification bodies shall be:

- (a) competent to carry out the certification and re-certification audits referred to in Article 9;
- (b) ***legally and financially*** independent from the operators or from a group of operators, and carry out the activities required under this Regulation in the public interest.

Proposal for a regulation
Article 10 – paragraph 3

Text proposed by the Commission

3. For the purpose of paragraph 2, point (b), certification bodies or any part thereof shall not:

(a) be an operator or a group of operators, the owner of an operator or of a group of operators, or be owned by them;

(b) have relations with operators or with a group of operators, that could affect their independence and impartiality.

Amendment

3. For the purpose of paragraph 2, point (b), certification bodies or any part thereof shall not:

(a) be an operator or a group of operators, the owner of an operator or of a group of operators, or be owned by them;

(b) have relations with operators or with a group of operators, that could affect their independence and impartiality.

Proposal for a regulation
Article 10 – paragraph 4

Text proposed by the Commission

4. Member States shall supervise the operation of certification bodies. Certification bodies shall submit, upon request by the national competent authorities, all relevant information necessary to supervise their operation, including date, time and location of the audits referred to in Article 9. Where Member States find issues of non-conformity, they shall inform the certification body and the relevant certification scheme thereof without delay.

Amendment

4. Member States ***and, where applicable, regional authorities*** shall supervise the operation of certification bodies. Certification bodies shall submit, upon request by the national ***and, when applicable, regional*** competent authorities, all relevant information necessary to supervise their operation, including date, time and location of the audits referred to in Article 9. Where Member States, ***and when applicable, regional authorities***, find issues of non-conformity, they shall inform the certification body and the relevant certification scheme thereof without delay ***and publish this notice in the Union registry referred to in Article 12.***

Proposal for a regulation
Recital 22

Text proposed by the Commission

(22) To ensure an accurate, robust and

Amendment

(22) To ensure an accurate, robust and

transparent verification, certification bodies responsible for performing the certification of **carbon removal** activities should have the required competences and skills and should be accredited by national accreditation authorities pursuant to Regulation (EC) No 765/2008 of the European Parliament and of the Council³². To avoid possible conflicts of interest, the certification bodies should also be completely independent from the operator carrying out the **carbon removal** activity that is subject to the certification. In addition, Member States should contribute towards ensuring the correct implementation of the certification process by supervising the operation of certification bodies that are accredited by national accreditation authorities, and by informing the certification schemes about relevant non-conformity findings.

³² Regulation (EC) No 765/2008 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 9 July 2008 setting out the requirements for accreditation and market surveillance relating to the marketing of products and repealing Regulation (EEC) No 339/93 (OJ L 218, 13.8.2008, p. 30).

transparent verification, certification bodies responsible for performing the certification of activities should have the required competences and skills and should be accredited by national accreditation authorities pursuant to Regulation (EC) No 765/2008 of the European Parliament and of the Council³². To avoid possible conflicts of interest, the certification bodies should also be completely **legally and financially** independent from the operator carrying out the activity that is subject to the certification. In addition, Member States **and, where applicable, regional authorities**, should contribute towards ensuring the correct implementation of the certification process by supervising the operation of certification bodies that are accredited by national accreditation authorities, and by informing the certification schemes about relevant non-conformity findings.

³² Regulation (EC) No 765/2008 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 9 July 2008 setting out the requirements for accreditation and market surveillance relating to the marketing of products and repealing Regulation (EEC) No 339/93 (OJ L 218, 13.8.2008, p. 30).

<p>Compromise Amendment 14 Article 11(2), (3), (4) and (5), Recital 23 (Operation of certification schemes) Compromise amendment replacing Amendments 72-73; 784-804, AGRI 101 and corresponding amendments on recitals 278-283, ITRE 27, AGRI 25</p>

Proposal for a regulation
Article 11 – paragraph 2

Text proposed by the Commission

2. Certification schemes shall operate on the basis of reliable and transparent rules and procedures, in particular with regard to internal management and monitoring, handling of complaints and appeals, stakeholder consultation, transparency and publication of information, appointment and training of certification bodies, addressing non-conformity issues, development **and management of registries**.

Amendment

2. Certification schemes shall operate on the basis of reliable and transparent rules and procedures, in particular with regard to internal management and monitoring, handling of complaints and appeals, stakeholder consultation, transparency and publication of information, appointment and training of certification bodies **and addressing non-conformity issues. For the purpose of handling complaints and appeals, certification schemes shall put in place easily accessible complaint and appeal procedures. Those rules and procedures shall be made publicly available in the Union registry referred to in Article 12.**

**Proposal for a regulation
Article 11 – paragraph 3**

Text proposed by the Commission

3. Certification schemes shall verify if the information and data submitted by the operator or a group of operators for the certification of compliance pursuant to Article 9 were subject to independent auditing and if the certification of compliance **was** carried out in an accurate, reliable, and cost-effective manner.

Amendment

3. Certification schemes shall verify if the information and data submitted by the operator or a group of operators for the certification of compliance pursuant to Article 9 were subject to independent auditing and if the certification of compliance **and the re-certification audit reports were** carried out in an accurate, reliable, and cost-effective manner.

**Proposal for a regulation
Article 11 – paragraph 4**

Text proposed by the Commission

4. Certification schemes shall publish, at least annually, a list of the appointed certification bodies, stating for each certification body by which entity or national public authority it was recognised and which entity or national public

Amendment

4. Certification schemes shall publish, at least annually, a list of the appointed certification bodies **in the Union registry referred to in Article 12**, stating for each certification body by which entity or national **or, where applicable, regional** public authority it was recognised and

authority is monitoring it.

which entity or national *or, where applicable, regional* public authority is monitoring it.

Proposal for a regulation **Article 11 – paragraph 5**

Text proposed by the Commission

5. The Commission shall adopt implementing acts setting out the structure, format, technical details and process referred to in paragraphs 2, 3 and 4, which shall apply to all certification schemes. Those implementing acts shall be adopted in accordance with the examination procedure referred to in Article 17.

Amendment

5. The Commission shall ***no later than 12 months after this regulation entering into force*** adopt implementing acts setting out the structure, format, technical details and process referred to in paragraphs 2, 3 and 4, which shall apply to all certification schemes. Those implementing acts shall be adopted in accordance with the examination procedure referred to in Article 17.

Proposal for a regulation **Recital 23**

Text proposed by the Commission

(23) Certification schemes should be used by operators to demonstrate compliance with this Regulation. Therefore, certification schemes should operate on the basis of reliable and transparent rules and procedures and should ensure accuracy, reliability, integrity and non-repudiation of origin, and protection against fraud of information and of data submitted by operators. They should also ensure the correct accounting of the verified carbon removal units, notably by avoiding double counting. To this end, the Commission should be empowered to adopt implementing acts, including adequate standards of reliability, transparency, accounting and of independent auditing to be applied by certification schemes, so as to ensure the necessary legal certainty as regards the rules applicable to operators and to certification schemes. To ensure a cost-effective certification process, those

Amendment

(23) Certification schemes should be used by operators to demonstrate compliance with this Regulation. Therefore, certification schemes should operate on the basis of reliable and transparent rules and procedures and should ensure accuracy, reliability, integrity and non-repudiation of origin, and protection against fraud of information and of data submitted by operators. They should also ensure the correct accounting of the verified units ***generated by a certified activity***, notably by avoiding double counting. To this end, the Commission should be empowered to adopt implementing acts, including adequate standards of reliability, transparency, accounting and of independent auditing to be applied by certification schemes, so as to ensure the necessary legal certainty as regards the rules applicable to operators and to certification schemes. To ensure a cost-

technical harmonised rules on certification should also have the objective of reducing unnecessary administrative burden for operators, or group of operators, in particular for Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs), including small farmers and foresters.

effective certification process, those technical harmonised rules on certification should also have the objective of reducing unnecessary administrative burden for operators, or group of operators, in particular for Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs), including small farmers and foresters.

Compromise Amendment (Registry)	15	Article 12, Annex IIa (new), Recital 25-26
Compromise amendment replacing Amendments 74-76; 81; 806-827; 924; AGRI 102-104; ITRE 48 and corresponding amendments on recitals 23; 287-294, AGRI 26, ITRE 28		

Proposal for a regulation
Article 12 – title

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Registries

Union registry

Or. en

Proposal for a regulation
Article 12 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

1. *A certification scheme* shall establish and duly maintain a public registry to make publicly ***accessible*** the information related to the certification process, ***including the certificates and updated certificates, and the quantity of carbon removal units certified in accordance with Article 9. Those registries*** shall use automated systems, including electronic templates, ***and shall be interoperable.***

1. ***The Commission*** shall establish and duly maintain a public registry (***‘Union registry’***) to make publicly ***available*** the information related to the certification process ***in an accessible way, containing, as a minimum, the information set out in Annex 2a. The Union registry*** shall use automated systems, including electronic templates.
A certification scheme shall submit all relevant data and reporting that is required to be included in the Union registry in accordance with Annex 2a and that is necessary to verify compliance with the requirements laid down in this

Proposal for a regulation
Article 12 – paragraph 2

Text proposed by the Commission

2. The Commission *may* adopt implementing acts setting out the structure, format, and technical details of ***the public registries, and of the recording, holding or use of carbon removal units***, as referred to in paragraph 1. Those implementing acts shall be adopted in accordance with the examination procedure referred to in Article 17.

Amendment

2. The Commission ***shall no later than 12 months after the entry into force of this Regulation*** adopt implementing acts setting out the structure, format, and technical details of the ***Union registry and the rules and procedures for providing all the information*** as referred to in paragraph 1. Those implementing acts shall be adopted in accordance with the examination procedure referred to in Article 17.

Proposal for a regulation
Article 12 – paragraph 2a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

The Commission shall ensure that certification schemes report the average share of the revenues related to the sale of certified units for each activity which it passed on to the operator. The Commission shall assess the submitted reports and annually report its findings to the European Parliament and to the Council.

Proposal for a regulation
Annex 2 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

ANNEX 2a

Minimum information to be included in the Union registry referred to in Article 12
For each certified activity, the Union registry referred to in Article 12 shall

include at least the following minimum information:

(a) name and type of the activity, including whether the activity constitutes a carbon removal activity, a carbon farming sequestration activity, a carbon farming emissions reduction activity for carbon, nitrogen or methane, or a carbon storage in products activity, the name and contact details of the operator or group of operators;

(b) effective start date and expected end date of the activity;

(c) name of the certification scheme;

(d) the Member State where the activity takes place;

(e) the certification methodology for each activity, in accordance with Article 8;

(f) the expected net benefit;

(g) the current status of the certificate (active, withdrawn, expired);

(h) where applicable, the physical or legal holder of a certified unit, the purpose for which that certified unit is held and the price paid to the operator;

(i) for each activity, a link to the certification audit report and, where applicable, updated audit report, in accordance with Article 9;

The Union registry referred to in Article 12 shall also include a list of all recognised certification schemes, their rules and procedures in accordance with Article 11(2), their annual activity reports in accordance with Article 14, the list of their appointed certification bodies, stating for each certification body by which entity or national public authority it was recognised and which entity or national public authority is monitoring it, in accordance with Article 11(4).

Text proposed by the Commission

(25) The provisions of the United Nations Economic Commission for Europe (UNECE) Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters³³ ('the Aarhus Convention') regarding access to information, public participation in decision-making, and access to justice in environmental matters, in particular the provisions relating to public participation and to access to justice remain applicable, where relevant.

³³ Council Decision 2005/370/EC of 17 February 2005 on the conclusion, on behalf of the European Community, of the Convention on access to information, public participation in decision-making and access to justice in environmental matters (OJ L 124, 17.5.2005, p. 1).

Proposal for a regulation
Recital 26

Text proposed by the Commission

(26) **Certification schemes** should establish and maintain **interoperable public registries** in order to ensure transparency and full traceability of carbon removal certificates, and to avoid the risk of fraud and double counting. Fraud may occur if more than one certificate is issued for the same **carbon removal** activity because the activity has been registered under two different certification schemes or has been registered twice under the same scheme. Fraud may also occur when the same certificate is used several times to make the same claim based on a carbon removal activity or a carbon **removal unit**. **The registries** should **store** the documents resulting from the certification process **of carbon removals**, including summaries of certification audits and re-certification

Amendment

(25) The provisions of the United Nations Economic Commission for Europe (UNECE) Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters³³ ('the Aarhus Convention') regarding access to information, public participation in decision-making, and access to justice in environmental matters, in particular the provisions relating to public participation and to access to justice remain applicable, where relevant.

³³ Council Decision 2005/370/EC of 17 February 2005 on the conclusion, on behalf of the European Community, of the Convention on access to information, public participation in decision-making and access to justice in environmental matters (OJ L 124, 17.5.2005, p. 1).

Amendment

(26) **The Commission** should establish and maintain **an interoperable and public Union registry** in order to ensure transparency, **trust** and full traceability of certificates, and to avoid the risk of fraud and double counting. Fraud may occur if more than one certificate is issued for the same activity because the activity has been registered under two different certification schemes or has been registered twice under the same scheme. Fraud may also occur when the same certificate is used several times to make the same claim based on an activity or unit. **All information in the Union registry** should **be easy to navigate and search**. **Certification schemes should provide to the Commission all information required to be stored and made publicly available in electronic form in the Union**

audit reports, the certificates and updated certificates, and make them publicly available in electronic form. ***The registries should also record the certified carbon removal units that meet the Union quality criteria.*** In order to ensure a level playing field within the single market, the Commission should be empowered to adopt implementing rules setting out ***standards and technical rules on the functioning and the inter-operability of those registries.***

registry. Such information includes the documents resulting from the certification process, including certification audits and re-certification audit reports, the certificates and updated certificates and the information included therein, the current status of a certified unit, for example whether active, retired/in use, or expired, log of transactions and, if applicable, the current holder and purpose for which it is held and the price paid to the operator. Prior to the establishment of the Union public registry, certification schemes recognised by the Commission should maintain and store all the information required to be stored and made publicly available later on the Union registry. In order to ensure a level playing field within the single market, the Commission should be empowered to adopt implementing rules ***on the structure, format, and technical details of the Union registry and the rules and procedures for certification schemes to provide the information to the Union registry.***

<p>Compromise Amendment</p> <p>Compromise amendment replacing Amendments 829-839; AGRI 105 and corresponding Amendments on recitals 284-286</p>	<p>16</p>	<p>Article 13, Recital 24 (Recognition of certification schemes)</p>
--	------------------	---

Proposal for a regulation
Article 13 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

1. Only a certification scheme recognised by the Commission by means of a decision may be used by operators or group of operators to demonstrate compliance with this Regulation. Such decision shall be valid for a period of no more than 5 years.

Amendment

1. Only a certification scheme recognised by the Commission by means of a decision may be used by operators or group of operators to demonstrate compliance with this Regulation. Such decision shall be valid for a period of no more than 5 years ***and shall be made public in the Union registry referred to in Article 12. The Commission shall inform about its decision for recognition no later than one month after the notification was***

administered.

Or. en

Proposal for a regulation
Article 13 – paragraph 2

Text proposed by the Commission

2. A Member State shall notify to the Commission the application for recognition of the public certification scheme. The legal representative of a private certification scheme shall notify to the Commission the application for recognition of the private certification scheme.

Amendment

2. A Member State, ***or where relevant, the regional authorities,*** shall notify to the Commission the application for recognition of the public certification scheme. The legal representative of a private certification scheme shall notify to the Commission the application for recognition of the private certification scheme.

Proposal for a regulation
Article 13 – paragraph 3

Text proposed by the Commission

3. The Commission may repeal a decision recognising a certification scheme pursuant to paragraph 1 where the certification scheme fails to implement the standards and rules set out in the implementing acts referred to in Article 11(5). Where a Member State raises concerns that a certification scheme does not operate in accordance with the standards and rules set out in the implementing acts referred to in Article 11(5) that constitute the basis for decisions under paragraph 1, the Commission shall investigate the matter and take appropriate action, including repealing the relevant decision.

Amendment

3. The Commission may, ***after appropriate consultation with the certification scheme,*** repeal a decision recognising a certification scheme pursuant to paragraph 1 where the certification scheme fails to implement the standards and rules set out in the implementing acts referred to in Article 11(5). Where a Member State ***or, where applicable, a regional authority*** raises concerns, ***or where a legal person, operator or group of operators raises duly substantiated concerns,*** that a certification scheme does not operate in accordance with the standards and rules set out in the implementing acts referred to in Article 11(5) that constitute the basis for decisions under paragraph 1, the Commission shall investigate the matter and take appropriate action, including repealing the relevant decision.

Or. en

Proposal for a regulation
Article 13 – paragraph 4

Text proposed by the Commission

4. The Commission *may* adopt implementing acts setting out the structure, format, and technical details of the notification and recognition processes referred to in paragraphs 1 and 2. Those implementing acts shall be adopted in accordance with the examination procedure referred to in Article 17.

Amendment

4. The Commission ***shall no later than 12 months after this regulation entering into force*** adopt implementing acts setting out the structure, format, and technical details of the notification and recognition processes referred to in paragraphs 1 and 2. Those implementing acts shall be adopted in accordance with the examination procedure referred to in Article 17.

Proposal for a regulation
Recital 24

Text proposed by the Commission

(24) In order to ensure a reliable and harmonised control of certification, the Commission should be able to adopt decisions recognising certification schemes that meet the requirements set out in this Regulation, including with respect to technical competence, reliability, transparency and independent auditing. Such recognition decisions should be limited in time. To this end, the Commission should be empowered to adopt implementing acts on the content and processes of Union recognition of certification schemes.

Amendment

(24) In order to ensure a reliable and harmonised control of certification, the Commission should be able to adopt decisions recognising certification schemes that meet the requirements set out in this Regulation, including with respect to technical competence, reliability, transparency and independent auditing. Such recognition decisions should be limited in time ***and should be made publicly available***. To this end, the Commission should be empowered to adopt implementing acts on the content and processes of Union recognition of certification schemes.

Compromise Amendment

17

Article 14, Recital 27 (Reporting requirements)

Compromise amendment replacing Amendments 840-846; 850 and corresponding Amendments on recitals 24; 295-298

Proposal for a regulation
Article 14 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

1. Each certification scheme recognised by the Commission shall submit to the Commission an annual report about its operations, including a description of any cases of fraud and related remediation measures. The report shall be submitted annually by 30 April, covering the preceding calendar year. The requirement to submit a report shall apply only to certification schemes that have operated for at least 12 months.

Amendment

1. Each certification scheme recognised by the Commission shall submit to the Commission an annual report about its operations, including a description of any cases of fraud and related remediation measures. The report shall be submitted annually by 30 April, covering the preceding calendar year. The requirement to submit a report shall apply only to certification schemes that have operated for at least 12 months.

Or. en

Proposal for a regulation
Article 14 – paragraph 2

Text proposed by the Commission

2. The Commission shall make those reports publicly available, in full or, where necessary to preserve the confidentiality of commercially sensitive information, in an aggregated form.

Amendment

2. The Commission shall make those reports publicly available ***in the Union registry referred to in Article 12***, in full or, where necessary to preserve the confidentiality of commercially sensitive information ***in conformity with the relevant Union and national law, excluding this commercially sensitive information.***

Proposal for a regulation
Article 14 – paragraph 3

Text proposed by the Commission

3. The Commission ***may*** adopt implementing acts setting out the structure, format, and technical details of the reports referred to in paragraph 1. Those implementing acts shall be adopted in accordance with the examination procedure referred to in Article 17.

Amendment

3. The Commission ***shall no later than 12 months after this regulation entering into force*** adopt implementing acts setting out the structure, format, and technical details of the reports referred to in paragraph 1. Those implementing acts shall be adopted in accordance with the examination procedure referred to in Article 17.

Proposal for a regulation
Recital 27

Text proposed by the Commission

(27) Certification schemes play an important role in providing evidence of compliance with the quality criteria for carbon removals. It is therefore appropriate for the Commission to require certification schemes to report regularly on their activity. Such reports should be made public, in full or where appropriate in an aggregated format, in order to increase transparency and to improve supervision by the Commission. Furthermore, such reporting would provide the necessary information for the Commission to report on the operation of the certification schemes with a view to identifying best practices and submitting, if appropriate, a proposal to further promote such best practices. In order to ensure comparable and consistent reporting, the Commission should be empowered to adopt implementing acts setting out the technical details on the content and format of the reports drawn up by the certification schemes.

Amendment

(27) Certification schemes play an important role in providing evidence of compliance with the quality criteria for carbon removals. It is therefore appropriate for the Commission to require certification schemes to report regularly on their activity. Such reports should be made public, in full or where ***necessary to preserve the confidentiality of commercially sensitive information in conformity with the relevant Union and national law, excluding this commercially sensitive information***, in order to increase ***public*** transparency, ***trust, traceability and scrutiny***, and to improve supervision by the Commission. Furthermore, such reporting would provide the necessary information for the Commission to report on the operation of the certification schemes with a view to identifying best practices and submitting, if appropriate, a proposal to further promote such best practices. In order to ensure comparable and consistent reporting, the Commission should be empowered to adopt implementing acts setting out the technical details on the content and format of the reports drawn up by the certification schemes.

Compromise Amendment	18	Article 14a (new) (Technical assistance)
-----------------------------	-----------	---

Compromise amendment replacing Amendments 334, 484, 766, 783, 805, 828		
--	--	--

Proposal for a regulation
Article 14a (new)

14a. The Commission shall provide technical guidance to the Member States on the implementation of Articles 9 paragraph 4 and Article 13 paragraphs 2 and 3.

Compromise Amendment

19

Article 16(2)-(5), Recital 28 (Exercise of delegation)

Compromise amendment replacing Amendments 856-863 and corresponding Amendments on recitals 299-302; AGRI 27

Proposal for a regulation
Article 16 – paragraph 2 and 3

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

2. The power to adopt delegated acts referred to in Articles 8 and 15 shall be conferred on the Commission for an indeterminate period of time from [PO: please insert the date = the date of entry into force of this Regulation].
3. The delegation of power referred to in Articles 8 and 15 may be revoked at any time by the European Parliament or by the Council. A decision to revoke shall put an end to the delegation of the power specified in that decision. It shall take effect the day following the publication of the decision in the Official Journal of the European Union or at a later date specified therein. It shall not affect the validity of any delegated acts already in force.

2. The power to adopt delegated acts referred to in Articles **3a**, 8 and 15 shall be conferred on the Commission for an indeterminate period of time from [PO: please insert the date = the date of entry into force of this Regulation].
3. The delegation of power referred to in Articles **3a**, 8 and 15 may be revoked at any time by the European Parliament or by the Council. A decision to revoke shall put an end to the delegation of the power specified in that decision. It shall take effect the day following the publication of the decision in the Official Journal of the European Union or at a later date specified therein. It shall not affect the validity of any delegated acts already in force.

Proposal for a regulation
Article 16 – paragraph 4

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

4. Before adopting a delegated act, the Commission shall consult experts designated by each Member State in

4. Before adopting a delegated act, the Commission shall **conduct a 4-week public consultation and shall** consult experts

accordance with the principles laid down in the Inter-institutional Agreement of 13 April 2016 on Better Law-Making.

designated by each Member State in accordance with the principles laid down in the Inter-institutional Agreement of 13 April 2016 on Better Law-Making.

Or. en

Proposal for a regulation **Article 16 – paragraph 5**

Text proposed by the Commission

5. Delegated acts adopted pursuant to Articles 8 and 15 shall enter into force only if no objection has been expressed either by the European Parliament or the Council within a period of 2 months of notification of that act to the European Parliament and to the Council or if, before the expiry of that period, the European Parliament and the Council have both informed the Commission that they will not object. That period shall be extended by 2 months at the initiative of the European Parliament or of the Council.

Amendment

5. Delegated acts adopted pursuant to Articles **3a**, 8 and 15 shall enter into force only if no objection has been expressed either by the European Parliament or the Council within a period of 2 months of notification of that act to the European Parliament and to the Council or if, before the expiry of that period, the European Parliament and the Council have both informed the Commission that they will not object. That period shall be extended by 2 months at the initiative of the European Parliament or of the Council.

Or. en

Proposal for a regulation **Recital 28**

Text proposed by the Commission

(28) To enable operators to apply the quality criteria set out in this Regulation in a standardised and cost-effective way, while taking into account the specific characteristics of different **carbon removal** activities, the power to adopt acts in accordance with Article 290 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union should be delegated to the Commission to supplement this Regulation by establishing detailed certification methodologies for different types of carbon removal activities. The Commission should also be able to amend Annex II listing the minimum information to be contained in the certificates. It is of particular

Amendment

(28) To enable operators to apply the quality criteria set out in this Regulation in a standardised and cost-effective way, while taking into account the specific characteristics of different activities, the power to adopt acts in accordance with Article 290 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union should be delegated to the Commission to supplement this Regulation by establishing detailed certification methodologies for different types of activities. The Commission should also be able to amend Annex II listing the minimum information to be contained in the certificates. It is of particular importance that the Commission

importance that the Commission carry out appropriate consultations during its preparatory work, including at expert level, and that those consultations be conducted in accordance with the principles laid down in the Interinstitutional Agreement of 13 April 2016 on Better Law-Making³⁴. In particular, to ensure equal participation in the preparation of delegated acts, the European Parliament and the Council receive all documents at the same time as Member States' experts, and their experts systematically have access to meetings of Commission expert groups dealing with the preparation of delegated acts.

carry out appropriate consultations during its preparatory work, including at expert level ***and through public consultations for all draft delegated acts for a period of at least four weeks***, and that those consultations be conducted in accordance with the principles laid down in the Interinstitutional Agreement of 13 April 2016 on Better Law-Making³⁴. In particular, to ensure equal participation in the preparation of delegated acts, the European Parliament and the Council receive all documents at the same time as Member States' experts, and their experts systematically have access to meetings of Commission expert groups dealing with the preparation of delegated acts.